

# **Quarter-4 Output Monitoring Report**

FY 2016-17

**City Governance Project**  
Local Government Engineering Department



## Table of Contents

Abbreviation.....	i-iii
Executive Summary.....	iv-vii
1. Introduction.....	1
2. Process followed to carryout monitoring.....	1
3. Limitations of the monitoring.....	1
4. Monitoring Findings.....	2
4.1 Component-1: Inclusive City Governance Improvement Action Program (ICGIAP).....	2
Area-1: Improvement of Openness and Information Dissemination.....	2
Area-2: Administrative Reform.....	7
Area 3: Tax Reform.....	14
Area 4: Financial Reform.....	17
Area 5: Citizen’s Awareness and Participation.....	21
Area 6: Urban Planning and Environment Improvement.....	29
Area 7: Coordination System for Law Enforcement.....	35
4.2 Component-2: Infrastructure Development.....	37
5. Challenges of the program.....	43

## List of Tables

Activity 1.1: Activity for e-governance initiated (T1).....	2
Activity 1.2: Mass Communication Cell (MCC) established (T2).....	3
Activity 1.3: City information Service Center (CISC) established.....	4
Activity 1.4: Meet with Mass public of City Corporation.....	5
Activity 2.1: City Development Coordination Committee (CDCC) established (T3).....	7
Activity 2.2: Administrative Reform Committee (ARC) established.....	7
Activity 2.3: Vision and mission set in each Dept.....	8
Activity 2.4: CDU established, and formulate training program (T4).....	9
Activity 2.5: Job descriptions revised.....	10
Activity 2.6: Initiate Kaizen Activity.....	11
Activity 2.7: Comprehensive Planning Unit (CPU).....	12
Activity 2.8: Activate Standing Committees.....	13
Activity 2.9: Annual administrative report prepared and published.....	14
Activity 3.1: Improve capability/efficiency of tax assessment (T5).....	14
Activity 3.2: Interim tax assessment carried out throughout the year and collection increased.....	15
Activity 3.3: Re-identification of source of tax.....	16
Activity 4.1: Introduce “financially independent accounting system” in water supply and waste management sector (T6).....	17
Activity 4.2: Diversify earnings from Business Operated by CCs (T7).....	17
Activity 4.3: Establish integrated computer systems.....	18

Activity 4.4: Financial statement prepared, and internal audit department carryout audit within 3 months after the closure of fiscal year .....	18
Activity 4.5: Non-tax own revenue source increased at least by inflation rate in each year .....	19
Activity 4.6: All due debts to GOB and other entities fully repaid according the schedule.....	19
Activity 4.7: Outstanding bills older than 3 months, including: I. electricity and II. Telephone, paid in time.....	20
Activity 4.8: Budget proposal is compared with the budget and actual outlays in the previous year, displayed at the CC office.....	21
Activity 5.1: Civil Society Coordination Committee (CSCC) (T8).....	21
Activity 5.2: Establishment of Ward Level Coordination Committee (WLCC) (T9) .....	23
Activity 5.3: Integration of Community and Formation of Community Group (CG) .....	24
Activity 5.4: Gender action plan (GAP) prepared .....	25
Activity 5.5: Poverty reduction action plan (PRAP) prepared and implemented with inclusion of slum.....	26
Activity 5.6: Revision of citizen charter .....	27
Activity 5.7: Citizen report cards prepared, approved and implemented by CSCC.....	28
Activity 5.8: Grievance -redress cell (GRC) established with revised terms of reference and functional.....	29
Activity 6.1: Initiate/update master plan.....	29
Activity 6.2: Development control implemented (T10),.....	30
Activity 6.3: Practical use of City Corporation Infrastructure Development Plan (CCIDP) .....	31
Activity 6.4: Establish O&M action plan.....	32
Activity 6.5: Environmental Conservation Act and Environment Framework (T11) .....	32
Activity 6.6: Sanitary Situation .....	33
Activity 6.7: Solid Waste Management (T12).....	34
Activity 7.1: Awareness campaign for Rule of Law (T13).....	35
Activity 7.2: Law Enforcement Unit (LEU) established.....	35
Activity 7.3: Capacity development for Standing Committee for Law and Discipline implemented.....	37

## **Abbreviations**

APs	Affected Persons
ARC	Administrative Reform Committee
ARSP	Administrative Reform Strategic Plan
As req.	As require
B1	Batch One
B2	Batch Two
BDT	Bangladesh Taka
BME	Benefit Monitoring and Evaluation
CAP	Community Action Plan
CBO	Community Based Organization
CC	City Corporation
CCIDP	City Corporation Infrastructure Development Plan
CDA	Chittagong Development Authority
CDC	Community Development Committee
CDCC	City Development Coordination Committee
CDU	Capacity Development Unit
CEO	Chief Executive Officer
CG	Community Group
CGP	City Governance Project
ChCC	Chittagong City Corporation
CISC	City Information Service Center
CMIS	City Management Information System
CoCC	Comilla City Corporation
CPU	Comprehensive Planning Unit
Cr.	Course
CRC	Citizen Report Card
CSCC	Civil Society Coordination Committee
DAPs	Detail Area Plans
Dept.	Department
DMDP	Dhaka Metropolitan Development Plan
DoE	Department of Environment
E-governance	Electronic governance
E. ser.	Electronic Service
F&E	Financial and Establishment
Feas.	Feasible

FY	Financial Year
GAP	Gender Action Plan
GCC	Gazipur City Corporation
GICD	Governance Improvement and Capacity Development
GO	Government Organization
GOB	Government of Bangladesh
GRC	Grievance Redress Cell
ICGIAP	Inclusive City Governance Improvement Action Program
ID	Identification
IDPCC	Inclusive Development Plan of City Corporation
IFMS	Integrated Financial Management Software
IGAs	Income Generating Activities
ICT	Information Communication and Technology
IT	Information Technology
LEU	Law Enforcement Unit
LGD	Local Government Division
LGED	Local Government Engineering Department
MCC	Mass Communication Cell
MIS	Management Information System
N/A	Not Applicable
NCC	Narayanganj City Corporation
NGO	Non-government Organization
O&M	Operation and Maintenance
PCO	Project Coordination Office
PIU	Project Implement Unit
PRAP	Poverty Reduction Action Plan
PRO	Public Relation Officer
PS	Private Secretary/ Personal Secretary
PSC	Project Steering Committee
Q2, Y3	Quarter Two, Year Three
Q3, Y3	Quarter Three, Year Three
3R	Reduce, Recycle & Reuse
RAJUK	Rajdhani Unnayan Kartipakkha
RpCC	Rangpur City Corporation
SAE	Sub-assistant Engineer
SC	Standing Committee
SMS	Sort Message Service

SW	Solid Waste
SWM	Solid Waste Management
SWMC	Solid Waste Management Committee
T1	Trigger one
T2	Trigger Two
ToR	Terms of Reference
TR	Test Relief
VGD	Vulnerable Group Development
VGf	Vulnerable Group Feeding
W	Ward
WASA	Water Supply and Sewerage Authority
WG	Working Group
WIT	Work Improvement Team
WLCC	Ward Level Coordination Committee
WM	Waste Management
WS	Water Supply



## Executive Summary

---

Governance Improvement and Capacity Development (GICD) is one of the main component of City Governance Project (CGP), which output is improve and develop capacity of project City Corporations (Narayanganj City Corporation-NCC, Comilla City Corporation-CoCC, Rangpur City Corporation-RpCC, Gazipur City Corporation-GCC and Chittagong City Corporation-ChCC). City Corporations implement governance improvement thirteen trigger and twenty nine non-trigger activities through Inclusive City Governance Improvement Action Program (ICGIAP) consists of seven areas, forty two activities and total 251 tasks. The activities are supported by training, facilitation, administrative reform, services to citizens, reducing gender discrimination, poverty reduction and intensively monitor to assess the performance. Performance based fund allocation is applied for this project, so that City Corporations have incentive to achieve the thirteen selected targets in ICGIAP. City Corporations are implemented most of the activities as quarterly basis. BME is mandated to assess the progress and performance of physical works and governance improvement activities in each targeted CC with defined reporting procedure. BME could not physically verify the fruitfulness of most events like meetings, campaigns, trainings, workshops as because there is no plan of City Corporations to BME. BME monitors the outputs/benefits of those activities quarterly based on the documents as completion evidence.

### Governance Improvement Component

#### Area-1: Improvement of Openness and Information Dissemination

34 monitored tasks of total 4 activities are being implemented under area-1 up to Q4, Y3. Out of 8 tasks under activity 1.1 (T1), NCC attended 63% tasks, CoCC & GCC 50% each and RpCC & ChCC attended 63% tasks each. Out of 11 tasks under activity 1.2 (T2), NCC & GCC attended 64% tasks each, CoCC 45% and RpCC & ChCC attended 55% tasks each. Out of 7 tasks under activity 1.3, NCC attended 86% tasks; CoCC & ChCC 71% each and RpCC & GCC attended 57% tasks each. Out of 8 tasks under activity 1.4, NCC & RpCC attended 88% tasks each, GCC & ChCC 75% each and CoCC attended 0% tasks.

**However, considering the 34 monitored tasks of 4 activities under area 1, NCC attended 74% task, CoCC 41%, RpCC 68%, GCC 59% and ChCC attended 65% task till Q4, Y3.**

#### Area-2: Administrative Reform.

57 monitored tasks of total 9 activities are being implemented under area-2 up to Q4, Y3. Out of 5 tasks under activity 2.1 (T3), each CC (5) attended 80% tasks. Out of 9 tasks under activity 2.2, NCC, RpCC, GCC & ChCC attended 33% tasks each and CoCC attended 22% tasks. Out of 6 tasks under activity 2.3, NCC, RpCC, GCC & ChCC attended 83% tasks each and CoCC attended 50% tasks. Out of 6 tasks under activity 2.4 (T4), NCC, RpCC & GCC attended 50% tasks each, CoCC 33% and ChCC attended 67% tasks. Out of 4 tasks under activity 2.5, NCC, RpCC & ChCC attended 70% tasks each and CoCC & GCC didn't attended any tasks each. Out of 10 tasks under activity 2.6, NCC & ChCC attended 40% tasks each, CoCC 20% and RpCC & GCC attended 50% tasks each. Out of 9 tasks under activity 2.7, NCC, RpCC, GCC & ChCC attended 78% tasks each and CoCC attended 56% tasks. Out of 5 tasks under activity 2.8, each CC (5) attended 80% tasks. Out of 3 tasks under activity 2.9, NCC, CoCC, GCC & ChCC attended 100% tasks each and RpCC attended 0% tasks.

**However, considering the 57 monitored tasks of 9 activities under area 2, NCC attended 63% tasks, CoCC 60%, RpCC 60%, GCC 60% and ChCC attended 65% tasks till Q4, Y3.**

### **Area-3: Tax Reform**

18 monitored tasks of total 3 activities are being implemented under area-3 up to Q4, Y3. Out of 9 tasks under activity 3.1, RpCC attended 100% task, NCC, CoCC & GCC 89% each and ChCC attended 78% tasks. Out of 6 tasks under activity 3.2, NCC & RpCC attended 100% tasks each, CoCC, GCC & ChCC attended 83% tasks each. Out of 3 tasks under activity 3.3, each CC (5) attended 100% tasks.

**However, considering the 18 monitored tasks of 3 activities under area 3, NCC attended 94% tasks, CoCC 89%, RpCC 100%, GCC 89% and ChCC attended 83% tasks till Q4, Y3.**

### **Area-4: Financial Reform**

27 monitored tasks of total 8 activities are being implemented under area-4 up to Q4, Y3. Out of 4 tasks under activity 4.1 (T5), each CC (5) attended 50% tasks. Out of 2 tasks under activity 4.2 (T6), each CC (5) attended 100% tasks. Out of 2 tasks under activity 4.3, none of the CC attended any tasks, i.e. 0% each because, PCO could not provide Integrated Financial Management Software (IFMS). Out of 4 tasks under activity 4.4, NCC & ChCC attended 50% tasks each, CoCC & GCC 25% each and RpCC attended 75% tasks. Out of 4 tasks under activity 4.5, NCC, RpCC, GCC & ChCC attended 100% tasks each and CoCC attended 75% tasks. Out of 3 tasks under activity 4.6, NCC, CoCC & GCC attended 100% tasks each and RpCC & ChCC attended 67% tasks each. Out of 5 tasks under activity 4.7, NCC, RpCC & GCC attended 80% tasks each, CoCC 6% and ChCC attended 100% tasks. Out of 3 tasks under activity 4.8, NCC, CoCC, GCC and ChCC attended 100% tasks each and RpCC didn't attend any task, i.e. 0%.

**However, considering the 27 monitored tasks of 8 activities under area-4, NCC attended 74% tasks, CoCC 63%, RpCC 74%, GCC 70% and ChCC attended 74% tasks.**

### **Area-5: Citizen's Awareness and Participation**

63 monitored tasks of total 8 activities are being implemented under area-5. Out of 11 tasks under activity 5.1 (T7), NCC, CoCC, RpCC & ChCC attended 55% task each and GCC attended 64% tasks. Out of 7 tasks under activity 5.2 (T8), NCC, CoCC, RpCC & GCC attended 57% tasks each and ChCC attended 71% tasks. Out of 7 tasks under activity 5.3, NCC, CoCC & ChCC attended 29% tasks each and RpCC & GCC attended 14% tasks each. Out of 6 tasks under activity 5.4, NCC & ChCC attended 17% tasks each, CoCC 33%, RpCC 67% and GCC attended 50% tasks. Out of 17 tasks under activity 5.5, NCC, RpCC & ChCC attended 71% tasks each, CoCC 65% and GCC attended 76% tasks. Out of 4 tasks under activity 5.6, each CC (5) attended 100% tasks. Out of 5 tasks under activity 5.7, each CC (5) attended 60% tasks. Out of 6 tasks under activity 5.8, each CC (5) attended 25% tasks.

**However, considering the 63 monitored tasks of 8 activities under area-5, NCC attended 54% tasks, CoCC 54%, RpCC 57%, GCC 59% and ChCC attended 56% tasks.**

### **Area-6: Urban Planning and Environment Improvement**

36 monitored tasks of total 7 activities are being implemented under area-6. Out of 5 tasks under activity 6.1, NCC attended 40% tasks and CoCC, RpCC, GCC & ChCC attended 40% tasks each. Out of 4 tasks under activity 2 (T9), NCC, CoCC, RpCC & GCC attended 100% tasks each and ChCC attended 50% tasks. Out of 4 tasks under activity 6.3,

NCC, CoCC, RpCC & GCC attended 100% tasks each and ChCC attended 75% tasks. Out of 2 tasks under 6.4, each CC (5) attended 50% tasks. Out of 4 tasks under activity 6.5 (T10), each CC (5) attended 100% tasks. Out of 7 tasks under activity 6.6, each CC (5) attended 29% tasks. Out of 10 tasks under activity 6.7 (T11), NCC attended 60% tasks and CoCC, RpCC, GCC & ChCC attended 50% tasks each.

**However, considering the 36 monitored tasks of 7 activities under area-6, NCC attended 64% tasks, CoCC 56%, RpCC 56%, GCC 56% and ChCC attended 47% tasks till Q4, Y3.**

#### **Area-7: Coordination System for Law Enforcement**

16 tasks of 3 activities are being implemented under area-7. Out of 5 tasks under activity 7.1 (T12), each CC (5) attended 100% tasks. Out of 8 tasks under activity 7.2, NCC attended 88% tasks, CoCC & GCC 75% each and RpCC & ChCC attended 63% tasks each. Out of 3 tasks under activity 7.3 (T13), NCC attended 100% tasks; RpCC, GCC & ChCC attended 67% each and CoCC attended 33% tasks.

**However, considering the 16 monitored tasks of 3 activities under area-7, NCC attended 94% tasks, CoCC 75%, RpCC 75%, GCC 81% and ChCC attended 75% tasks till Q4, Y3.**

**Considering total 251 monitored tasks, NCC attended 68%, tasks, CoCC 55%, RpCC 65%, GCC 63% and ChCC attended 63% tasks till Q4, Y3.**

#### **Infrastructure Development Component**

Urban Infrastructure development is also one of the main component of City Governance Project (CGP), which outputs to construct 419.99 km. road, 2903 m bridge/overpass, 196.47 km. drain and retaining wall as protective work, 11650 street lights, 6 water supply systems, 2 bus/truck terminals provided and 8 school cum cyclone shelters in CCs.

BME monitored physical and financial progress of Batch-1 and Batch-2 sub-project (civil works) till Q4, Y3 and summary findings are below:

##### **NCC, Batch-1:**

Out of total 3 sub-projects under batch-1, NCC completed physical work of 2 sub-projects (package 2 & 3) and followed by 88% payment progress of both and remaining one sub-project (package-1) completed physical work 94.5% followed by 85% payment progress till Q4, Y3.

##### **NCC, Batch-2:**

Out of total 12 sub-projects under batch-2, construction work just started 3 sub-projects (package 04, 05 & 06) and made 7, 2 & 3% progress respectively, besides, signed contract for package 3 & 11 sub-projects till Q4, Y3.

##### **CoCC, Batch-1:**

Out of total (9-1) 8 sub-projects under batch-1, completed 100% civil work of all package (1-7 & 9) followed by final payment of 7 packages (1, 2, 4, 5, 6, 7 and 9); and for the rest **one** package (3) final payment is under preparation till Q4, Y3.

**CoCC, Batch-2:** tenders are under processes for all 9 packages till Q4, Y3.

**RpCC, Batch-1:**

Out of total 18 sub-projects, completed 100% civil work of seven packages (1, 3, 5, 9, 13, 14 & 17) followed by 100%, 98%, 94%, 86%, 68%, 80% & 85% payment progress respectively; 90-98% civil work of five packages (7, 8, 10, 12, & 18) followed by 87%, 72%, 85%, 82% & 90% payment progress respectively; 87%, 85%, 85%, 87% & 85% civil work of five packages (2, 6, 11, 15 & 16) followed by 84%, 63%, 54%, 79% & 72% payment progress respectively; and completed 60% civil work of remaining one package (4) followed by 54% payment progress till Q4, Y3.

**RpCC, Batch-2:**

Out of total 25 sub-projects, started civil work of five packages (15, 16, 17, 18 & 19) and made progress 2%, 7%, 3%, 8% & 5% respectively; besides, signed contract for seven packages (5, 7, 8, 9, 14, 20 & 23) till Q4, Y3.

**GCC, Batch-1**

Out of total 9 sub-projects, completed 100% civil work of three packages (2, 6 & 9) followed by 79%, 89% & 84% payment progress respectively; 80-90% civil work progress of two packages (7 & 8) followed by 69% & 43% payment progress respectively; 60-70% civil work of three packages (1, 4 & 5) followed by 37%, 27% & 41% payment progress respectively; and completed 46% civil work of remaining one package (3) followed by 29% payment progress till Q4, Y3.

**GCC, Batch-2**

Out of total 14 sub-projects, started civil work of eight packages (3, 4, 7, 9, 10, 11, 12 & 13), made progress 2%, 2%, 9%, 3%, 3%, 2%, 2%, & 13% respectively, besides signed contracts for three packages (2, 6 & 8) till Q4, Y3

**ChCC Batch-1**

Out of total (18-2) 16 sub-projects, completed 100% civil work of six packages (1, 2, 4, 11, 12 & 13) followed by 74%, 60%, 92%, 79%, 85% & 84% payment progress respectively; 90-95% civil work progress of four packages (3, 7, 8, & 17) followed by 81%, 85%, 84% & 85% payment progress respectively; 70-85% civil work progress of five packages (6, 9, 10, 15 & 18) followed by 63%, 74%, 60%, 75% & 76% payment progress respectively and completed 40% civil work of remaining one package (16) followed by 22% payment progress till Q4, Y3.

**ChCC Batch-2**

Out of 17 sub-projects, signed contract for four packages (10, 12, 13 & 17) till Q4, Y3.

## **1. Introduction**

Benefit Monitoring and Evaluation (BME) consultant team on behalf of Project Coordination Office (PCO) carried out this output monitoring produced through ICGIAP and Infrastructure Development activities till quarter-4 of the project year-3.

The objectives of monitoring were to-

- Support PCO and PIU to assess regular progress
- Facilitate proper implementation of the project interventions
- Extract lessons learned in the form of providing feedback for possible improvements, and
- Assess consistency of the progress according to plans and targets.

## **2. Process followed to carryout monitoring**

The consultant teams followed mostly collaborative, interactive, consultative, feedback sharing, and participatory processes to carry out output monitoring for quarter-4 of the project year-3. Broadly following steps were followed to carry out this assignment:

1. Defined boundary in terms of components, areas, activities, tasks, targets and timeline up to Q4 project Y3
2. Review and updated tool for field data collection
3. Conducted introductory meeting with each City Corporation officials and authorities
4. Collected information from concerned city corporation officials and verified at real situations
5. Shared initial findings with concerned city corporation officials and authorities to validate collected information and receive feedbacks for further development, and
6. Shared summery findings with project authorities and GICD personnel.

## **3. Limitations of the monitoring**

Among others, the monitoring team largely faced following limitations:

- This Q4, Y3 output monitoring was confined to ICGIAP and Infrastructure Development activities implemented at city corporation levels
- Absence of annual implementation plans and inadequate progress reports
- Limited physical verification of outputs produced till Q4, Y3
- Frequent turnover of focal persons at CC levels
- Council election at Comilla City Corporation
- Different ICGIAP document introduced at field level
- Inadequate documentary evidences in support of produced outputs, and
- Second Preliminary Performance Review and Q4 output monitoring went hand to hand.

## 4. Monitoring Findings

### 4.1 Component-1: Inclusive City Governance Improvement Action Program (ICGIAP)

#### Area-1: Improvement of Openness and Information Dissemination

#### Activity 1.1: Activity for e-governance initiated (T1)

Sub-activity/Task	Target till Q-4, Y-3	NCC		CoCC		RpCC		GCC		ChCC	
		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress	
		Till Q-3, Y-3	In Q-4, Y-3								
1.1.1 Assigned officer/ staff in charge for e-governance	1/CC	Yes	N/A								
1.1.2 Arranged IT based Training for concern CC staff <sup>1</sup>	1 Cr./CC	Yes	N/A								
1.1.3 Organized exchange visit to other CC's introduced e-governance (As part of IT training)	1 Cr./CC	No	No								
1.1.4 Arranged component wise training <sup>2</sup>	9 Cr./CC	No	No								
1.1.5 Developed web based MIS software	1/CC	No	No	No	No	Yes	N/A	No	No	No	No
1.1.6 Established e-services <sup>3</sup> with SMS system	e-service/CC	Yes	Yes	Yes	No	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
1.1.7 Prepared long-term plan for e-governance	1/CC	No	Yes	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	Yes
1.1.8 Established dynamic Web Portal for birth/death registration, citizen charter, trade license etc.	1/CC	Yes	N/A								

N/A= Not applicable, Cr= Course

#### Analysis:

**1.1.1 Assigned officer/staff in-charge for e-governance**, all CCs (5) assigned officer/staff in-charge for e-governance before Q2, Y3.

**1.1.2 Arranged IT based Training for concern CC staff**, all CCs (5) provided two types of training "Basic Computer" & "E-governance" to concern CC's staff before Q2, Y3.

**1.1.3 Organized exchange visit to other CC's introduced e-governance (as part of IT training)**, none of the CC (5) arranged exchange visit as an integral part of "E-governance" training till Q4, Y3.

**1.1.4 Arranged component wise training**, all CCs (5) provided training on "Basic Computer" (reported in 1.1.2), but no component (8) wise training was organized till Q4, Y3.

**1.1.5 Developed web based MIS software**, only RpCC introduced MIS software in July 2015 and has turned into web base CMIS software in January 2017. None of the rest CCs (4) developed and installed web based software for MIS till Q4, Y3.

**1.1.6 Established e-services with SMS system**, NCC linked property management system with SMS; RpCC linked with trade license issue & renew and birth & death registration; GCC linked with trade license

<sup>1</sup> Staff who are involved in operation of e-governance system

<sup>2</sup> Trainings are on basic computer, tax assessment software, tax collection section, water billing software, trade license software, market management software, birth & death registration and orientation, non-motorized vehicle management software, town information service center

<sup>3</sup> As mentioned in the long-term plan of City Corporation, including digitizing certificates and licenses

issue & renew *and* ChCC linked trade license issue & renew with SMS, but not fully in accordance with e-governance long term plan. *CoCC did not linked any kind of e-services with SMS till Q4, Y3.*

**1.1.7 Prepared long-term plan for e-governance**, NCC and ChCC prepared long term plan for e-governance implementation for the period of 5 years (FY 2014-15 to 2019-20 and FY 2017-18 to 2021-22 respectively) in Q4, Y3. *Rest CCs (3) did not prepare long-term plan for e-governance implementation till Q4, Y3.*

**1.1.8 Established dynamic Web Portal for birth/death registration, Citizen Charter, Trade License etc.** RpCC introduced dynamic web portal for birth & death registration, e-tendering, trade license, citizen charter etc. and uploaded on website and continuing till Q4, Y3. *Rest CCs (4) somehow, computerized above-mentioned items but not added with dynamic web portal till Q4, Y3.*

**Activity 1.2: Mass Communication Cell (MCC) established (T2)**

Sub-activity/Task	Target till Q-4, Y-3	NCC		CoCC		RpCC		GCC		ChCC	
		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress	
		Till Q-3, Y-3	In Q-4, Y-3								
1.2.1 Established MCC <sup>4</sup> with specific ToR	1/CC	Yes	N/A								
1.2.2 Prepared annual plans & budget	3/CC	No	No	No	No	Yes	No	No	No	No	No
1.2.3 MCC submitted annual plans & Budget to CCCC for review	3/CC	No	No								
1.2.4 MCC submitted annual plans & Budget to CC for approval	3/CC	No	No								
1.2.5 Selected messages and materials for campaign approved by Mayor	5/CC	Yes	Yes	No	No	Yes	No	Yes	No	Yes	N/A
1.2.6 Registered disseminated SMS to at least 7500 citizens by Year 3	7500/CC	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	N/A	Yes	Yes
1.2.7 Disseminated message/materials/updates annually to public through different medias including SMS <sup>5</sup>	6/CC	Yes	Yes								
1.2.8 Held MCC meeting <sup>6</sup>	12 /CC	Yes	Yes								
1.2.9 Prepared/ introduced SMS record keeping system	As req.	Yes	Yes								
1.2.10 MCC conducted impact survey on SMS information dissemination	As req.	No	No								
1.2.11 MCC prepared City Corporation Annual Report	3/CC	No	Yes	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No

*N/A= Not applicable, Cr= Course*

**Analysis:**

**1.2.1 Established MCC with specific ToR**, all CCs (5) established MCC headed by Secretary before Q2, Y3. *CoCC did not follow composition as recommended in ToR i.e. SAE selected as Member Secretary instead of PRO and 2 members selected from tax dept.*

<sup>4</sup> Comprises of Secretary, Public Relation Officer, Head of IT section, Officer of each department selected by department head

<sup>5</sup> **Specific** items are large scale infrastructure work that affect citizen's life, cultural program, political gathering etc. and **special** items are regular meeting of CCCC, WLCC, City Council, CDCC, and mass public meeting; free vaccination, new services started in CC office, special meetings, and ICGIAP activities, like campaign for law enforcement, disaster alert, large scale infrastructure work and traffic control etc.

<sup>6</sup> Quarterly

**1.2.2 Prepared annual plans & budget, MCC at RpCC prepared plans and budget only for FY 2016-17 before Q2, Y3 but not included in CC budget, while none of the MCC (5) prepared such plans and budget for 2017-18 till Q4, Y3.**

**1.2.3 MCC submitted annual plans & Budget to CSCC for review, none of the MCC (5) submitted FY 2017-18 annual plans & budget to respective CSCC for review till Q4, Y3.**

**1.2.4 MCC submitted annual plans & Budget to CC for approval, none of the MCC (5) submitted FY 2017-18 annual plans & budget to respective CC for approval till Q4, Y3.**

**1.2.5 Selected messages and materials for campaign approved by Mayor, MCC at NCC received approval of selected messages and materials for 2nd campaign from their respective Mayor on 24.06.2017 for FY 2016-17, but MCC at RpCC & GCC did not receive approval of selected messages and materials for 2nd campaign and CoCC did not have such initiative at all till Q4, Y3.**

**1.2.6 Registered and disseminated SMS to 7500 citizens by Year- 3, NCC, CoCC, RpCC and ChCC registered 10,000 citizens and GCC 7500 citizens for dissemination of specific and special information through SMS till Q4, Y3. None of the CC has schedule for information dissemination.**

**1.2.7 Disseminated message/materials/updates to public through different media including SMS, all CCs (5) generally uses local newspapers, publicity boards, leaflets, posters, stickers, miking, cable network, website and rally to disseminate public information in regards to seasonal/occasional greetings, regular municipal tax payment, health and education, law enforcement, waste deposit to particular place etc. till Q4, Y3. In regards to select messages, CCs need to pay attention to specific and special project related items.**

**1.2.8 Held MCC meeting, out of targeted 12, NCC held total 7 MCC quarterly meetings, CoCC held 5, RpCC held 7, GCC held 5 and ChCC held total 7 MCC quarterly meetings till Q4, Y3. MCC quarterly meeting dates are at NCC on 15.06.2017, CoCC on 05.06.2017, RpCC on 18.05.2017, GCC on 15.05.2017 and at ChCC held MCC quarterly meeting on 18.06.2017 in Q4, Y3.**

**1.2.9 Prepared/introduced SMS record keeping system, all CCs (5) introduced and maintained both digital and manual SMS record keeping system till Q4, Y3.**

**1.2.10 MCC conducted impact survey on SMS information dissemination, none of the MCC (5) conducted impact survey on SMS information dissemination till Q4, Y3.**

**1.2.11 MCC prepared City Corporation Annual Report, MCC at NCC prepared annual report in Q4, Y3 only for FY 2016-17, but rest MCC (4) did not prepare annual report for CCs till Q4, Y3.**

**Activity 1.3: City information Service Center (CISC) established**

Sub-activity/Task	Target till Q-4, Y-3	NCC		CoCC		RpCC		GCC		ChCC	
		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress	
		Till Q-3, Y-3	In Q-4, Y-3								
1.3.1 Established CISC <sup>7</sup>	1/CC	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	Yes	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A
1.3.2 Assigned officer/staff in charge	1/CC	Yes	N/A								
1.3.3 Provided necessary logistics	As req./CC	Yes	N/A								
1.3.4 Trained <sup>8</sup> relevant officials on e-governance	1/CC	Yes	No	Yes	No	No	No	No	No	Yes	No
1.3.5 Provided service <sup>9</sup> of CISC	As req.	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	No	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes

<sup>7</sup> An electronic based ICT facilitated one-stop service center at each City Corporation to provide basic services for citizens, such as issue certificates, licenses, uphold citizens' rights etc.

<sup>8</sup> CC officials & staffs who are involved in CISC operation and Communication Standing Committee members on e-governance orientation meeting, ICT basic skills and ongoing e-governance activities

Sub-activity/Task	Target till Q-4, Y-3	NCC		CoCC		RpCC		GCC		ChCC	
		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress	
		Till Q-3, Y-3	In Q-4, Y-3								
1.3.6 CISC operated according to operation plan	3/CC	No	No								
1.3.7 CISC prepared annual report	3/CC	No	Yes	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No

N/A= Not applicable; P/I= Process Initiated

**Analysis:**

**1.3.1 Established CISC**, all CCs (5) established CISC before Q2, Y3 and allocated space except RpCC. RpCC allocated space for CISC in Q4, Y3.

**1.3.2 Assigned officer/staff in charge**, NCC and CoCC assigned officer/staff in-charge before Q2, Y3 and RpCC, GCC & ChCC assigned officer/staff in-charge for CISC operation in Q3, Y3.

**1.3.3 Provided necessary logistics**, PCO supplied chairs, tables, file cabinets, computers, printers and photocopiers to each CC for CISC use before Q2, Y3. *All CCs need to ensure use of those furniture and logistics at CISC outlet.*

**1.3.4 Trained relevant officials on e-governance**, NCC, CoCC and ChCC trained only one staff member each only on 'Basic Computer' before Q2, Y3, *but RpCC and GCC did not provide such training to any staff till Q4, Y3.*

*The potential training participant for e-governance are CC officers & staff members involved in CISC operation and members of the Standing Committee for Communication and courses are orientation meeting on e-governance, basic training on ICT skills, basic training on e-governance & ongoing e-governance activities.*

**1.3.5 Provided service of CISC**, NCC, CoCC, GCC and ChCC (5) are providing information on a few CC services to their citizens (such as issuing certificates & licenses, health services, engineering services, administrative services, education services, Tax/Fees/Rates) from CISC outlets till Q3, Y3, but RpCC from information desk. CISCs at GCC and RpCC started to provide information on government services (such as admission forms of colleges/schools) in Q4, Y3.

**1.3.6 CISC operated according to operation plan**, *none of the CISC (5) prepared operation plan and operated accordingly till Q4, Y3.*

**1.3.7 CISC prepared annual progress report**, only CISC at NCC prepared annual progress report in Q4, Y3, *but rest CISCs (4) didn't prepare annual progress report till Q4, Y3.*

**Activity 1.4: Meet with Mass public of City Corporation**

Sub-activity/Task	Target till Q-4, Y-3	NCC		CoCC		RpCC		GCC		ChCC	
		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress	
		Till Q-3, Y-3	In Q-4, Y-3								
1.4.1 Selected issues for mass public meeting	As req.	Yes	Yes	No	No	Yes	No	Yes	No	Yes	N/A
1.4.2 Examined selected issues	As req.	Yes	No	No	No	Yes	No	No	No	No	No

<sup>9</sup> **CC Services**- tax assessment, tax collection, water supply and collection, trade license issue & renewal, non-motorized vehicle license issue & renewal, birth & death registration, tender, building plan permission, road cutting, drain cutting, market & hat lease, street light, waste management, dog control, mosquito control, city clean, and virus influence. **Government Services**-public examination results, online university admission, government forms, birth & death registration, citizenship certificate, VGD/VGF list, government circulars and notices, agriculture and health consultancy, govt. life insurance, services of CC office, development (VGD, VGF, TR, minority welfare, sports & cultural activities, development of educational institutions), revenue (tax assessment, trade license, building plan permission, land acquisition money, requisition, certificate suit, hat & bazaar, vested property, exchange property, stamp vendor license, land survey), license (C.I sheet, cement, poison, food grain), complain & remedy (pension, land, family affairs, law & orders), relief & rehabilitation (donation, grant, GR), certification (marriage, NGO) and miscellaneous (different committee approval, different appointments, dramatically performance, expatriate welfare, examination matters)

Sub-activity/Task	Target till Q-4, Y-3	NCC		CoCC		RpCC		GCC		ChCC	
		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress	
		Till Q-3, Y-3	In Q-4, Y-3								
by Communication Standing Committee											
1.4.3 Approved selected issues by CSCC & CC meeting	As req.	Yes	No	No	No	Yes	No	Yes	No	No	No
1.4.4 Declared <sup>10</sup> date for Mass Public Meeting by MCC	6/CC	Yes	Yes	No	No	Yes	No	Yes	No	No	Yes
1.4.5 Informed selected issues to the citizens at least one month before	As req.	Yes	Yes	No	No	Yes	Yes	Yes	No	Yes	Yes
1.4.6 Held Mass Public Meeting <sup>11</sup>	6/CC	Yes	No	No	No	Yes	Yes	Yes	No	Yes	No
1.4.7 Prepared report on Mass Public Meeting	6/CC	Yes	No	No	No	Yes	Yes	Yes	No	Yes	No
1.4.8 Prepared next year plans and specific budget for Mass Public Meeting	3/CC	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	Yes

N/A= Not Applicable

### Analysis:

**1.4.1 Selected issues for mass public meeting,** MCCs at RpCC selected 1<sup>st</sup> mass public meeting issues and ChCC for 1<sup>st</sup> and 2<sup>nd</sup> in Q2, Y3; GCC in Q3, Y3 and NCC selected issues for 1<sup>st</sup> mass public meeting before Q1, Y3 and for 2<sup>nd</sup> meeting in Q4, Y3; *but CoCC did not select issues for any mass public meeting till Q4, Y3.*

**1.4.2 Examined selected issues by Communication Standing Committee,** MCC at NCC presented selected issues for 1<sup>st</sup> and 2<sup>nd</sup> (FY 2016-17) mass public meeting to Standing Committee for Communication in Q2 & Q4, Y3 for examination, while MCC at RpCC presented selected 1<sup>st</sup> mass public meeting issues in Q3, Y3. *But RpCC didn't select & present for the 2<sup>nd</sup> meeting issues; further, CoCC, GCC and ChCC didn't present selected issues for either of the mass public meeting to Standing Committee for Communication for examination till Q4, Y3.*

**1.4.3 Approved selected issues by CSCC & CC meeting,** MCC at NCC, RpCC and GCC obtained approval of selected 1<sup>st</sup> mass public meeting issues from CSCC and CC meeting, while ChCC obtained directly from the Mayor. MCC at NCC and ChCC obtained approval of selected 2<sup>nd</sup> mass public meeting issues directly from the Mayor bypassing CSCC and CC meeting. *RpCC and GCC did not select and present 2<sup>nd</sup> mass public meeting issues for approval from CSCC and CC meeting and CoCC not did so ever.*

**1.4.4 Declared date for Mass Public Meeting through different media by MCC,** MCC at NCC and ChCC declared 2<sup>nd</sup> mass public meeting date on --/---/--- and 7.6.2017 respectively. *Rest MCCs (3) didn't declare date for 2<sup>nd</sup> mass public meeting till Q4, Y3.*

**1.4.5 Informed selected issues to the citizens at least one month before,** MCC at RpCC informed selected 1<sup>st</sup> mass public meeting issues to citizens, while MCC at NCC & ChCC informed 2<sup>nd</sup> mass public meeting issues in FY 2016-17 a month before, in Q4, Y3.

**1.4.6 Held Mass Public Meeting,** RpCC held 1<sup>st</sup> mass public meeting on 17.5.2017, while NCC and ChCC held 2<sup>nd</sup> mass public meeting on 23.7.2017 & 31.7.2017 respectively. *But RpCC and GCC did not hold 2<sup>nd</sup> mass public meeting and CoCC any till Q4, Y3.*

**1.4.7 Prepared report on Mass Public Meeting,** MCC at RpCC prepared 1<sup>st</sup> mass public meeting report in Q4, Y3, while, NCC and ChCC prepared 2<sup>nd</sup> mass public meeting report, held in FY 2017-18.

<sup>10</sup> Declared date for public meeting through notice board, SMS delivery, radio, TV, social media, website, announcement, microphone, poster and banner hanging in significant places etc.

<sup>11</sup> At least twice a year

**1.4.8 Prepared next year plans and specific budget for Mass Public Meeting,** MCC at ChCC prepared mass public meeting plans and specific budget for FY 2017-18, while rest MCCs (4) did not prepare plans and specific budget for FY 2017-18 till Q4, Y3.

## Area-2: Administrative Reform

### Activity 2.1: City Development Coordination Committee (CDCC) established (T3)

Sub-activity/Task	Target till Q-4, Y-3	NCC		CoCC		RpCC		GCC		ChCC	
		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress	
		Till Q-3, Y-3	In Q-4, Y-3								
2.1.1 Established CDCC <sup>12</sup> with specific ToR	1/CC	Yes	N/A	Yes	Yes	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A
2.1.2 Assigned officer in-charge	1/CC	Yes	N/A								
2.1.3 Organized workshop annually	2/CC	No	No								
2.1.4 Held CDCC quarterly meeting	12 /CC	Yes	Yes								
2.1.5 Distributed meeting minutes to the members	12 /CC	Yes	Yes								

N/A= Not Applicable

#### Analysis:

**2.1.1 Established CDCC with specific ToR,** CDCCs are established in all CCs (5) in accordance with the specific ToR before Q2, Y3. Among them, CDCCs at NCC and CoCC are re-established in Q3 & Q4, Y3 after sitting new elected City Council.

**2.1.2 Assigned officer in-charge,** all CCs (5) assigned officer in-charge for CDCC secretarial works, before Q2, Y3.

**2.1.3 Organized workshop,** none of the CC (5) organized inception and annual workshops on CDCC operation guideline till Q4, Y3.

**2.1.4 Held CDCC quarterly meeting,** out of targeted 12 CDCC quarterly meetings, NCC held total 7 meetings, CoCC 7, RpCC 8, GCC 8 and ChCC held total 7 CDCC quarterly meetings till Q4, Y3. The last CDCC meeting dates are 19.06.2017, 20.06.2017, 27.04.2017, 12.06.2017 and 23.05.2017 respectively.

**2.1.5 Distributed meeting minutes to the members,** all CDCCs (5) prepared meeting minutes and distributed among the members till Q4, Y3.

### Activity 2.2: Administrative Reform Committee (ARC) established

Sub-activity/Task	Target till Q-4, Y-3	NCC		CoCC		RpCC		GCC		ChCC	
		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress	
		Till Q-3, Y-3	In Q-4, Y-3								
2.2.1 Established Administrative Reform Committee <sup>13</sup> (ARC)	1/CC	Yes	N/A	Yes	No	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A
2.2.2 Organized workshop <sup>14</sup> on ARC	1/CC	Yes	N/A	No	No	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A
2.2.3 Conducted regular quarterly ARC meeting	12 /CC	Yes	Yes								
2.2.4 Produced ARC	1/CC	No	No								

<sup>12</sup> Comprises of Mayor, head of Standing Committees, CEO, representative of Private Sector and representatives of National agencies

<sup>13</sup> Comprises of Mayor, CEO, Secretary, and head of departments

<sup>14</sup> Orientation workshop for ARC members according contents described in guideline

Sub-activity/Task	Target till Q-4, Y-3	NCC		CoCC		RpCC		GCC		ChCC	
		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress	
		Till Q-3, Y-3	In Q-4, Y-3								
strategic plan for each department											
2.2.5 Reviewed ARSP in CSCC	1/CC	No	No								
2.2.6 Approved ARSP in CC meeting	1/CC	No	No								
2.2.7 Promote implementation of strategic plan of each department	1/Dpt./CC	No	No								
2.2.8 Quarterly monitoring of ARC strategic plan implementation	1/Dpt./CC	No	No								
2.2.9 ARC produced final report annually	3/CC	No	No								

N/A= Not Applicable, Dpt.= Department

**Analysis:**

**2.2.1 Established Administrative Reform Committee (ARC),** ARCs are established in all CCs (5) before Q2, Y3. NCC re-established in Q3, Y3 and *CoCC need to re-establish ARC after sitting new elected City Council.*

**2.2.2 Organized workshop on ARC,** NCC, RpCC, GCC and ChCC organized a day long workshop for ARC member’s on “ARC Operation Guideline” before Q2, Y3, *but CoCC didn’t organize such workshop till Q4, Y3.*

**2.2.3 Conducted regular quarterly ARC meeting,** out of targeted 12 ARC quarterly meetings, NCC held total 7 meetings, CoCC 2, RpCC 3, GCC 4 and ChCC held total 6 ARC quarterly meetings till Q 4, Y3. The ARC last quarterly meeting dates are 12.6.2017, 15.6.2017, 11.5.2017, 20.6.2017 and 8.6.2017 respectively.

**2.2.4 Produced ARC strategic plan for each department,** *none of the ARC (5) produced administrative reform strategic plan (ARSP) for each department till Q4, Y3.*

**2.2.5 Reviewed ARSP in CSCC,** *none of the CSCC (5) reviewed ARC strategic plan of each department. Since ARC strategic plans are not produce till Q4, Y3.*

**2.2.6 Approved ARSP in CC meeting,** *none of the City Council (5) approved ARSP of each department in their meetings. Since ARC strategic plans are not produced till Q4, Y3.*

**2.2.7 Promote implementation of strategic plan of each department,** *none of the ARC (5) promoted implementation of administrative reform Strategic Plan of each department. Since Strategic Plans are not prepared till Q4, Y3.*

**2.2.8 Quarterly monitor ARC strategic plan implementation,** *none of the ARC (5) monitored progress of administrative reform Strategic Plan implementation of each department. Since Strategic Plan for each department are not produced till Q4, Y3.*

**2.2.9 ARC produced final report annually,** *none of the ARC (5) produced annual report till Q4, Y3.*

**Activity 2.3: Vision and mission set in each Dept.**

Sub-activity/Task	Target till Q-4, Y-3	NCC		CoCC		RpCC		GCC		ChCC	
		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress	
		Till Q-3, Y-3	In Q-4, Y-3								
2.3.1 Assigned officers in-charge from each dept.	1/CC	Yes	N/A								

Sub-activity/Task	Target till Q-4, Y-3	NCC		CoCC		RpCC		GCC		ChCC	
		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress	
		Till Q-3, Y-3	In Q-4, Y-3								
2.3.2 Organized workshop <sup>15</sup> for preparing vision and mission	1/CC	Yes	N/A								
2.3.3 Presented draft vision and mission to standing committee meeting (Sports & Cultural)	As req/CC	No	No								
2.3.4 Approved vision and mission in City Council meeting	As req/CC	Yes	N/A	No	No	No	Yes	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A
2.3.5 Displayed vision and mission	As req.	Yes	N/A	No	No	No	Yes	No	Yes	No	Yes
2.3.6 Reviewed vision and mission	As req.	N/A	N/A								

N/A= Not Applicable

**Analysis:**

**2.3.1 Assigned officers in charge from each department,** reported that all CCs (5) assigned officer in-charge of each department to prepare own department’s vision & mission before Q3, Y3, *but no documentary evidence found.*

**2.3.2 Organized workshop for preparing vision and mission,** all CCs (5) organized workshop on “preparation of vision and mission” for assigned officer in-charge and relevant staff members of each department before Q2, Y3, *but workshop reports not found.*

**2.3.3 Presented draft vision and mission to standing committee meeting (Sports & Cultural),** *none of the department of CC’s presented their draft visions and missions for FY 2015-16 to Standing Committee for Sports and Culture for review prior to obtain approval from City Council meeting till Q4, Y3.*

**2.3.4 Approved vision and mission in City Council meeting,** the city council meeting of NCC, GCC and ChCC approved missions and visions of City Corporation as well as each department bypassing Standing Committee for Sports and Culture before Q2, Y3 and RpCC in Q4, Y3. *CoCC council meetings did not approve departments visions and missions till Q4, Y3.*

**2.3.5 Displayed vision and mission,** NCC displayed visions and missions in their website as well as reflected in Citizen Charter before Q2, Y3 and RpCC in Q4, Y3. GCC and ChCC displayed visions and missions in their CC websites in Q4, Y3, *but CoCC did not display vision and mission till Q4, Y3.*

**2.3.6 Reviewed vision and mission,** *none of the CC (5) went for annual review of visions and missions till Q4, Y3.*

**Activity 2.4: CDU established, and formulate training program (T4)**

Sub-activity/Task	Target till Q-4, Y-3	NCC		CoCC		RpCC		GCC		ChCC	
		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress	
		Till Q-3, Y-3	In Q-4, Y-3	Till Q-3, Y-3	In Q-4, Y-3	Till Q-2, Y-3	In Q-4, Y-3	Till Q-3, Y-3	In Q-4, Y-3	Till Q-2, Y-3	In Q-4, Y-3
2.4.1 Established CDU <sup>16</sup>	1/CC	Yes	N/A								
2.4.2 Formulated training program <sup>17</sup> (manual, plans, and budget etc.)	As req.	No	Yes	No	No	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A
2.4.3 CDU selected training service provider <sup>18</sup>	As req.	No	No								

<sup>15</sup> Workshop participants (32) are assigned officer, 25 officials/staffs from relevant departments, 5 CGP staffs, and 2 support staff from relevant departments

<sup>16</sup> Comprises of CEO, Secretary and heads of all departments

<sup>17</sup> Training program formulation steps are 1) review of ARP, 2) proposal for training, installation of equipment and Increase of manpower, 3) selection and formulation of Capacity Development Program, and 4) Kaizen Training

Sub-activity/Task	Target till Q-4, Y-3	NCC		CoCC		RpCC		GCC		ChCC	
		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress	
		Till Q-3, Y-3	In Q-4, Y-3	Till Q-3, Y-3	In Q-4, Y-3	Till Q-2, Y-3	In Q-4, Y-3	Till Q-3, Y-3	In Q-4, Y-3	Till Q-2, Y-3	In Q-4, Y-3
2.4.4 Facilitated/ proposed kaizen and skill training	As req.	Yes	N/A								
2.4.5 CDU Monitor implementation of Kaizen activities and technical training	As req.	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	Yes	No
2.4.6 Prepared quarterly progress and annual report on capacity development activities	12/CC & 3/CC	No	No								

N/A= Not Applicable

### Analysis:

**2.4.1 Established CDU**, CDUs are (5) established in all CCs before Q2, Y3.

**2.4.2 Formulated training program (manual, plans, budget etc.)**, CDUs (4) at NCC, RpCC, GCC and ChCC prepared training schedule for FY 2016-17, *but none prepared training program including manual, plans, budget etc. and CDU at CoCC didn't at all prepare training program till Q4, Y3.*

**2.4.3 CDU selected training service provider**, *none of CDU (5) selected training service provider till Q4, Y3.*

**2.4.4 Facilitated/proposed Kaizen and skill training**, all CCs (5) facilitated Kaizen and skill training for CDU members together with staff from each department (ref. 2.6.4) before Q3, Y3.

**2.4.5 CDU Monitor implementation of Kaizen activities and technical training**, only department heads at ChCC monitored their Kaizen activity implementation in Q3, Y3, *but none of the CDU (5) monitored implementation of Kaizen activities till Q4, Y3.*

**2.4.6 Prepared Quarterly and Annual progress report on capacity development activities**, *none of the CDU (5) prepared quarterly and annual progress reports till Q4, Y3.*

### Activity 2.5: Job descriptions revised

Sub-activity/Task	Target till Q-4, Y-3	NCC		CoCC		RpCC		GCC		ChCC	
		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress	
		Till Q-3, Y-3	In Q-4, Y-3								
2.5.1 Prepared revise job description for all staff	All staff/CC	Yes	N/A	No	No	Yes	N/A	No	No	Yes	N/A
2.5.2 Approved revise job descriptions by CC	All staff /CC	Yes	N/A	No	No	Yes	N/A	No	No	Yes	N/A
2.5.3 Circulated revised job descriptions to all staff	All staff /CC	No	No								
2.5.4 Job descriptions reviewed by CDU	As req.	N/A	N/A								

N/A= Not Applicable

### Analysis:

**2.5.1 Prepared revise job description for all staff**, NCC, RpCC and ChCC prepared job descriptions for all staff before Q2, Y3 and CEO of GCC instructed all department heads to prepare/revise job description for their staff in Q4, Y3. *CoCC didn't prepare staff Job description till Q4, Y3.*

**2.5.2 Approved revise job descriptions by CC**, NCC, RpCC and ChCC approved revise Staff Job Descriptions in their City Council meetings and subsequently submitted to the Ministry for concurrence before Q2, Y3. *CoCC and GCC council meeting did not approve Staff Job Descriptions till Q4, Y3.*

<sup>18</sup> Potential training Providers are: **GOB-** NILG, LGED, UMU, DPHE, BARD, RDA, DoSW, CCs, DoE; **Academic Institutions-** IoGS, BRAC University, BUET/CUET/Other universities and **NGOs/International Organizations-** IUCN Bangladesh; IEB, BIM, BIAM

**2.5.3 Circulated revised job descriptions to all staff, none of the CC (5) circulated revise job descriptions to all staff with official letter from Mayor, because they didn't receive concurrence from Ministry.**

**2.5.4 Job descriptions reviewed by CDU: the task has to be performed by Y4.**

**Activity 2.6: Initiate Kaizen Activity**

Sub-activity/Task	Target till Q-4, Y-3	NCC		CoCC		RpCC		GCC		ChCC	
		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress	
		Till Q-3, Y-3	In Q-4, Y-3								
2.6.1 Selected focal person <sup>19</sup> by CDU	1/Dept./CC	No	Yes	No	No	No	Yes	No	Yes	Yes	N/A
2.6.2 Formed work improvement team <sup>20</sup> (WIT)	1/Dept./CC	No	Yes	No	No	No	Yes	No	Yes	No	Yes
2.6.3 Developed action plan by WIT	1/Dept./CC	No	No	No	No	No	Yes	No	Yes	No	No
2.6.4 Trained one staff from each department on kaizen	1/Dept./CC	Yes	N/A								
2.6.5 Introduced Kaizen activity in each department	As req.	Yes	Yes	Yes	No	Yes	No	Yes	No	Yes	Yes
2.6.6 Made budget allocation for Kaizen activity	3/CC	No	No								
2.6.7 Compiled Annual progress report by CDU	3/CC	No	No								
2.6.8 Final report submitted to Mayor, and best practice prize given to one department	3/CC	No	No								
2.6.9 CDU conducted monitoring on progress report and field visit	3/CC	No	No								
2.6.10 Published Kaizen activity progress on website	As req.	No	No								

N/A= Not Applicable

**Analysis:**

**2.6.1 Selected focal person by CDU, CDU at NCC, RpCC and GCC selected focal person among members preferably head of department for one year duration to perform kaizen activities in own department during Q4, Y3 and ChCC before Q2, Y3. CoCC did not select any focal person till Q4, Y3.**

**2.6.2 Formed work improvement team (WIT), NCC, RpCC, GCC and ChCC formed 3-5-member WITs 10/10, 4/9, 5/18 departments for implementing kaizen activities till Q4, Y3, but CoCC could not form any WIT till Q4, Y3.**

**2.6.3 Developed action plan by WIT, the established WITs at RpCC prepared 4 annual action plan for implementing Kaizen activities in revenue, administration, engineering and urban planning departments and at GCC prepared 5 annual action plan for implementing Kaizen activities in administration, accounts, engineering, health and revenue departments during Q4, Y3, but WITs at NCC, CoCC and ChCC didn't prepare annual action plan till Q4, Y3.**

**2.6.4 Trained one staff from each department on kaizen, all CCs (5) provided a daylong training on "Kaizen activity" to ??/10, ??/12, ??/9, ??/18 and ??/7 department heads before Q2, Y3.**

**2.6.5 Introduced Kaizen activity in each department, NCC introduced 10 Kaizen activities (one in each department), in engineering, electricity, administration, license, tax, law, health & family planning, conservancy, library, and social welfare department; RpCC introduced 4 activities (one in each**

<sup>19</sup> Member of CDU are namely head of departments

<sup>20</sup> Comprises of 3-5 members from each department and chaired by head of the department

department) in revenue, administration, engineering and urban planning department; GCC introduced 5 activities (one in each department) in administration, accounts, engineering, health and revenue department; and ChCC introduced 7 Kaizen activities (one in each department) in finance & establishment, revenue, urban planning, conservancy, electricity, administration, and security departments during Q4, Y3, but CoCC did not introduce any Kaizen activities during Q4, Y3.

**2.6.6 Made budget allocation for Kaizen activity, none of the CC (5) made budget allocation for implementation of Kaizen activities in FY 2016-17 till Q4, Y3.**

**2.6.7 Compiled Annual progress report by CDU, none of the CDU (5) compiled their Annual report for Kaizen activities till Q4, Y3.**

**2.6.8 Final report submitted to Mayor, and best practice prize given to one department, none of the CDU (5) submitted final report of Kaizen activities to the Mayor and gave prize to the best practice department till Q4, Y3.**

**2.6.9 CDU conducted monitoring on progress report and field visit, none of the CDU (5) monitored Kaizen activities based on progress report and field visit till Q4, Y3.**

**2.6.10 Published Kaizen activity progress on website, none of the CDU (5) produced and published Kaizen activity progress report on their website till Q4, Y3.**

**Activity 2.7: Comprehensive Planning Unit (CPU)**

Sub-activity/Task	Target till Q-4, Y-3	NCC		CoCC		RpCC		GCC		ChCC	
		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress	
		Till Q-3, Y-3	In Q-4, Y-3								
2.7.1 Established CPU <sup>21</sup>	1/CC	Yes	N/A								
2.7.2 Established task force <sup>22</sup> for infrastructure	1/CC	Yes	N/A	No	No	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A
2.7.3 Established task force <sup>23</sup> for governance	1/CC	Yes	N/A	No	No	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A
2.7.4 Prepared draft short and long-term plan	4/CC 1/CC	Yes	Yes	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A
2.7.5 Available rolling plan as per IDPCC guideline	3/CC	Yes	N/A								
2.7.6 Conduct monthly CPU meeting	36/CC	Yes	Yes								
2.7.7 Conduct CPU meeting with Urban Planning and Development Standing Committee	36/CC	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	Yes
2.7.8 Present activity progress to City Council meeting	As req.	Yes	Yes	Yes	No	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
2.7.9 Prepared Annual report	3/CC	No	No								

N/A= Not Applicable

**Analysis:**

**2.7.1 Established CPU, all CCs (5) established CPU before Q2, Y3.**

**2.7.2 Established task force for infrastructure, NCC, RpCC, GCC and ChCC established Task Force for Infrastructure before Q2, Y3. CoCC did not establish Task Force for Infrastructure till Q4, Y3.**

<sup>21</sup> Comprises of head engineering department, town planner and head of relevant departments

<sup>22</sup> Comprises of 16 officials from relevant departments, 1 facilitator, and 2 officials

<sup>23</sup> Comprises of 16 officials from relevant departments, 1 facilitator, and 2 officials

**2.7.3 Established task force for governance**, NCC, RpCC, GCC and ChCC established Task Force for Governance before Q2, Y3. *CoCC did not establish Task Force for governance till Q4, Y3.*

**2.7.4 Prepared draft short and long-term plan**, all CPUs (5) prepared draft short and long-term plan for infrastructure development before Q2, Y3. *However, did not follow outline described in the project document.*

**2.7.5 Available rolling plan as per IDPCC guideline**, out of **targeted 3** annual rolling plans each, all CPUs (5) used to prepare IDP rolling plan for each year including FY 2016-17. *However, did not follow outline described in the project document.*

**2.7.6 Conduct monthly CPU meeting**, out of **targeted 36** CPU monthly meetings each, held 3 meetings out of total 19 at NCC, 1 out of 9 at CoCC, 1 out of 7 at RpCC, 3 out of 15 at GCC and held 1 out of total 5 CPU monthly meetings at ChCC during Q4, Y3. The CPU monthly meeting dates of Q4, Y3 are 30.4.2017, 28.5.2017, 18.6.2017; 30.4.2017; 21.6.2017; 17.04.2017, 30.05.2017, 22.06.2017; and 02.05.2017 respectively

**2.7.7 Conduct CPU meeting with Urban Planning and Development Standing Committee**, out of **targeted 36** monthly meeting each, CPU at ChCC had only one meeting with Urban Planning and Development Standing Committee during Q4, Y3 on 17/5/2017. *Rest CPUs (4) did not have any monthly meeting with Urban Planning and Development Standing Committee till Q4, Y3.*

**2.7.8 Present activity progress to City Council meeting**, all CPUs (5) at City Corporation level occasionally used to present their progress in Council meeting including Q4, Y3, *but discussion and decision points of CPU activities are not adequately reflected in council meeting minutes till Q4, Y3.*

**2.7.9 Prepared annual report**, out of **targeted 3** annual reports each, *none of the CPU (5) prepared any annual progress report till Q4, Y3.*

**Activity 2.8: Activate Standing Committees**

Sub-activity/Task	Target till Q-4, Y-3	NCC		CoCC		RpCC		GCC		ChCC	
		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress	
		Till Q-3, Y-3	In Q-4, Y-3								
2.8.1 Assigned officer to establish Standing Committees <sup>24</sup>	1/each SC	Yes	N/A	Yes	Yes	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A
2.8.2 Approved Standing Committees ToR by City Council	1/each SC	Yes	N/A								
2.8.3 Proposed Standing Committees ToR to ministry for concurrence	4/SC/CC	Yes	N/A								
2.8.4 Held Standing Committee monthly meetings	36/SC/CC	Yes	Yes	Yes	No	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
2.8.5 Prepared Annual Progress report by standing committees	3/SC/CC	No	No								

*N/A= Not Applicable*

**Analysis:**

**2.8.1 Assigned officer to establish Standing Committees**, all CCs (5) assigned one officer in-charge each to establish Standing Committees before Q3, Y3 *but CoCC has to re-assign officer in-charge on 21.06.2017 to established Standing Committees in Q4, Y3 after sitting new elected city council.*

**2.8.2 Approved Standing Committees ToR by City Council**, all City Councils (5) approved ToR for their established Standing Committees before Q2, Y3.

<sup>24</sup> One high/responsible officer in each CC

**2.8.3 Proposed Standing Committees ToR to ministry for concurrence**, all CCs (5) proposed Standing Committees ToR to the ministry for concurrence before Q2, Y3.

**2.8.4 Held Standing Committee monthly meetings**, standing committees meetings are held at NCC 18%, CoCC 15%, RpCC 10%, GCC 4% and at ChCC 93% compare to target of (168+16) 184 meetings in FY 2016-17. *It appears Standing Committee meetings are held need based, not monthly in accordance with CC Act 2009.*

**2.8.5 Prepared Annual Progress report by Standing Committees**, none of Standing Committee prepared their annual progress report till Q4, Y3.

**Activity 2.9: Annual administrative report prepared and published**

Sub-activity/Task	Target till Q-4, Y-3	NCC		CoCC		RpCC		GCC		ChCC	
		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress	
		Till Q-3, Y-3	In Q-4, Y-3								
2.9.1 Prepared draft Annual Administrative report	3/CC	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	No	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
2.9.2 Approved draft Annual Administrative report in CC meeting	2/CC	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	No	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
2.9.3 Annual Administrative report published	3/CC	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	No	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes

N/A= Not Applicable

**Analysis:**

**2.9.1 Prepared draft Annual Administrative report**, NCC, CoCC, GCC and ChCC prepared draft annual administrative reports for FY 2016-17, while RpCC did not prepare till Q4, Y3.

**2.9.2 Approved draft Annual Administrative report in CC meeting**, city council meeting at NCC, CoCC, GCC and ChCC approved their FY 2016-17 annual administrative reports in Q4, Y3.

**2.9.3 Annual Administrative report published**, NCC, CoCC, GCC and ChCC published their FY 2016-17 annual administrative reports.

**Area 3: Tax Reform**

**Activity 3.1: Improve capability/efficiency of tax assessment**

Sub-activity/Task	Target till Q-4, Y-3	NCC		CoCC		RpCC		GCC		ChCC	
		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress	
		Till Q-3, Y-3	In Q-4, Y-3								
3.1.1 Deployed senior tax assessor	1/CC	Yes	N/A								
3.1.2 Deployed tax assessors and collectors one/1000 holdings	As req.	Yes	N/A								
3.1.3 Introduced tax assessment manual/guideline prepared by PCO	As req.	Yes	N/A								
3.1.4 Received training on capacity development (deployed staff)	1/CC	Yes	N/A								
3.1.5 Conducted re- assessment in 5 years interval	As req.	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	Yes
3.1.6 Introduced software for tax assessment database	1/CC	Yes	N/A								
3.1.7 Created link system between "holding tax ID number" and construction	As req.	No	No	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	No	No	No	No

Sub-activity/Task	Target till Q-4, Y-3	NCC		CoCC		RpCC		GCC		ChCC	
		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress	
		Till Q-3, Y-3	In Q-4, Y-3								
registration											
3.1.8 Increased Tax collection	2/CC	Yes	Yes								
3.1.9 Prepared quarterly report	12/CC	Yes	Yes	Yes	No	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	No

N/A= Not Applicable

**Analysis:**

**3.1.1 Deployed senior tax assessor:** all CCs (5) employed and/or deployed senior Tax Assessor before Q2, Y3.

**3.1.2 Deployed tax assessors and collectors one/1000 holdings,** NCC deployed a total of 41 staff (tax assessors/collectors) in tax section, CoCC 44, RpCC 33, GCC 25 and ChCC deployed a total of 127 staff in tax section before Q2, Y3.

**3.1.3 Introduced tax assessment manual/guideline prepared by PCO,** all CCs (5) introduced PCO supplied tax assessment manual/guideline before Q2, Y3.

**3.1.4 Received training on capacity development (deployed staff),** deployed tax section staff of all CCs (5) received three days long skill up training on “Financial Management Software” from PCO before Q2, Y3.

**3.1.5 Conducted re- assessment in 5 years interval,** NCC and CoCC continuing tax re- assessment since in Q1, Y3 and ChCC completed within Q4, Y3. The tax re assessment for RpCC and GCC are not due yet.

**3.1.6 Introduced software for tax assessment database,** NCC, CoCC and ChCC introduced computerized system for tax assessment database. Rest of two CCs (RpCC & GCC) introduced MSU software for tax assessment database in 2016. *None of the CC uses IFM software, because the software not ready yet.*

**3.1.7 Created link system between holding tax ID number and construction registration,** CoCC and RpCC created link system between holding tax ID number and construction registration and continuing till Q4, Y3. *NCC, GCC and ChCC, needs to find ways because two different authorities RAJUK/CDA and City Corporations are involved in this regard.*

**3.1.8 Increased Tax collection,** NCC increased tax collection to 85%, CoCC 53%, RpCC 86%, GCC 96%, and ChCC increased tax collection to 30%. *CoCC and ChCC could not increase expected 85% target by Y4.*

**3.1.9 Prepared quarterly report,** NCC, RpCC and GCC used to prepare tax collection quarterly progress report, *but CoCC and ChCC did not prepare report in Q4, Y3 because of tax re-assessment work.*

**Activity 3.2: Interim tax assessment carried out throughout the year and collection increased**

Sub-activity/Task	Target till Q-4, Y-3	NCC		CoCC		RpCC		GCC		ChCC	
		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress	
		Till Q-3, Y-3	In Q-4, Y-3								
3.2.1 Identified missing holdings and bring them to assessment registration	As req.	Yes	Yes	Yes	No	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	No
3.2.2 Prepared quarterly progress report and present it City Corporation meeting	As req.	Yes	Yes	Yes	No	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	No
3.2.3 Review progress of interim assessment linking with Finance and Establishment Standing Committee and place the report to CC monthly meeting	As req.	Yes	Yes	Yes	No	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	No
3.2.4 Submitted quarterly tax collection	12/CC	Yes	Yes	Yes	No	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	No

progress report to PCO											
3.2.5 Prepared plan to increase holding tax collection efficiency up to 85%	1/CC	Yes	N/A	No	No	Yes	N/A	No	No	No	No
3.2.6 Increased tax collection efficiency	As req./CC	Yes									

N/A= Not Applicable, P/I= Process Initiated

**Analysis:**

**3.2.1 Identified missing holdings and bring them to assessment registration,** NCC, RpCC and GCC identified and included missing holdings on to their tax register book in Q4, Y3. *CoCC and ChCC did not identify and include missing holdings on to their tax register in this quarter because their regular 5 year interval assessment is ongoing.*

**3.2.2 Prepared quarterly progress report and present it City Corporation meeting,** NCC, RpCC and GCC prepared quarterly progress report on tax collection and assessment and presented to CC meeting in Q4, Y3. *CoCC and ChCC did not prepare quarterly progress report because their ongoing regular 5 year interval assessment.*

**3.2.3 Review progress of interim assessment,** F & E Standing Committees at NCC, RpCC and GCC reviewed progress of interim tax assessment and presented to City Council meetings in Q4, Y3. *F & E Standing Committees at CoCC and ChCC did not review progress of interim tax assessment, since start of 5 years interval tax assessment.*

**3.2.4 Submitted quarterly tax collection progress report to PCO,** NCC, RpCC and GCC submitted quarterly tax collection progress report to PCO in Q4, Y3 not following schedule/annex 8 of guideline, *but CoCC and ChCC did not submit tax collection progress report since start of interim tax assessment in Q3, Y3.*

**3.2.5 Prepared plan to increase holding tax collection,** NCC and RpCC prepared plan to increase holding tax collection up to 85% by project year 4 in Q3, Y3 and Q2, Y3 respectively, *but CoCC, GCC and ChCC did not prepare such plan till Q4, Y3.*

**3.2.6 Increased tax collection up to 85%,** NCC reached on to 85% holding tax collection efficiency CoCC 53%, RpCC 85.71%, GCC 96.33% and ChCC reached on to 30% holding tax collection efficiency till Q4, Y3 compare to 85% target by project year 4.

*Note that ChCC has due holding tax with 34 Government departments amounting of around BDT 133,541,012/= since long ago.*

**Activity 3.3: Re-identification of tax source**

Sub-activity/Task	Target till Q-4, Y-3	NCC		CoCC		RpCC		GCC		ChCC	
		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress	
		Till Q-3, Y-3	In Q-4, Y-3								
3.3.1 Examined re-identified new tax sources once a year by F&E Standing Committee	2/ CC	Yes	N/A								
3.3.2 Prepared proposal for new tax sources by F&E Standing Committee and submit to City Corporation	3/CC	N/A	N/A								
3.3.3 Held F&E Standing Committee meeting 4 times a year	12/CC	Yes	Yes								

N/A= Not Applicable

**Analysis:**

**3.3.1 Examined re-identified new tax sources once a year by F&E Standing Committee,** the F&E Standing Committees of all CCs examined re-identified new tax sources once a year till FY 2016-17.

**3.3.2 Prepared proposal for new tax sources by F&E Standing Committee and submit to City Corporation**, none of F&E Standing Committee prepared and submitted proposal for new tax source to City Council meeting till Q4, Y3, because they could not find any new tax sources.

**3.3.3 Held F&E Standing committee meeting 4 times a year,**

out of targeted 12 F&E Standing Committee quarterly meetings in each CC, NCC held 8 F&E Standing Committee meetings, CoCC 7, RpCC 8, GCC 8 and ChCC held 22 F&E Standing Committee quarterly meetings till Q4, Y3. Among the meetings NCC held 1, CoCC 1, RpCC 1, GCC 1 and ChCC held 3 in Q4, Y3.

**Area 4: Financial Reform**

**Activity 4.1: Introduce “financially independent accounting system” in water supply and waste management sector (T5)**

Sub-activity/Task	Target till Q-4, Y-3	NCC		CoCC		RpCC		GCC		ChCC	
		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress	
		Till Q-3, Y-3	In Q-4, Y-3								
4.1.1 Created independent bank account for WS and WM	2/CC	Yes	N/A								
4.1.2 Introduced computerize accounting system for WS and WM	2/CC	Yes	N/A								
4.1.3 Maintained independent loss and profit account of WS and WM	2/CC	No	No								
4.1.4 Properly adjusted water tariff and conservancy rates to recover O&M cost	As app.	No	No								

N/A= Not Applicable

**Analysis:**

**4.1.1 Created independent bank account for water supply and waste management**, CoCC, RpCC, and GCC (3) created independent bank account for water supply and waste management before Q2, Y3, but NCC and ChCC do not require creating independent bank account because in those areas water supply is operated by WASAs.

**4.1.2 Introduced computerize accounting system for water supply and waste management**, CoCC, RpCC, and GCC (3) introduced computerize accounting system for water supply and waste management, but NCC and ChCC introduced computerize accounting system for waste management only before Q2, Y3.

**4.1.3 Maintained independent loss and profit account of water supply and waste management**, all CCs (5) maintains monthly income and expenditure accounts for WS and WM wherever applicable, *but none of them maintains loss and profit account in real term till Q4, Y3.*

**4.1.4 Properly adjusted water tariff and conservancy rates to recover O&M cost**, all CCs (5) increased water tariff and conservancy rates over the years, *but didn't properly adjust to recover O&M cost till Q4, Y3.*

**Activity 4.2: Diversify earnings from Business Operated by CCs (T6)**

Sub-activity/Task	Target till Q-4, Y-3	NCC		CoCC		RpCC		GCC		ChCC	
		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress	
		Till Q-3, Y-3	In Q-4, Y-3								
4.2.1 Examined diversification of business operated by CC at F&E Standing Committee	3/CC	Yes	N/A								
4.2.2 Prepared proposal for new business activities at F&E Standing	3/CC	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	Yes	Yes	N/A	Yes	Yes

Committee and submitted to CC Council meeting for action according to CC Act 2009											
---	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--

N/A= Not Applicable

**Analysis:**

**4.2.1 Examined diversification of business operated by CC at F&E Standing Committee,** the F&E Standing Committees at CC level are used to examine diversity of business operated by CC to increase earnings and seek out new business in the CC territory annually till Q4, Y3.

**4.2.2 Prepared proposal for new business activities at F&E Standing Committee and submitted to CC Council meeting for action according to CC Act 2009,** all F&E Standing Committees at CC level prepared and submitted new business proposal as applicable to their CC council meeting for onward action before Q2, Y3. Besides, RpCC and ChCC prepared and submitted new business proposal on “joint venture CRP hospital” and “multi-stored shopping mall construction” respectively according to CC Act 2009 in Q4, Y3.

**Activity 4.3: Establish integrated computer systems**

Sub-activity/Task	Target till Q-4, Y-3	NCC		CoCC		RpCC		GCC		ChCC	
		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress	
		Till Q-3, Y-3	In Q-4, Y-3								
4.3.1 Installed the integrated software (IFMS) and linked to accounting, tax database, reserve fund for rehabilitation and budget	1/CC	No	No								
4.3.2 Provided staff training on operation of IFMS software	1/CC	No	No								

N/A= Not Applicable

**Analysis:**

**4.3.1 Installed the integrated financial management software (IFMS) and linked to accounting, tax database,** none of the CC (5) installed integrated financial management software (IFMS) link in to accounting and tax database, because IFMS is not ready till Q4, Y3.

**4.3.2 Provided staff training on operation of IFMS software,** none of the CC (5) provided training to the management level users and specific operational users at CC on “operation of IFM software”, because the software is not available and installed till Q4, Y3.

**Activity 4.4: Financial statement prepared, and internal audit department carryout audit within 3 months after the closure of fiscal year**

Sub-activity/Task	Target till Q-4, Y-3	NCC		CoCC		RpCC		GCC		ChCC	
		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress	
		Till Q-3, Y-3	In Q-4, Y-3								
4.4.1 Prepared financial statement within the following month of each FY	2/CC	Yes	N/A								
4.4.2 Disclosed financial statement at CC notice board	2/CC	No	No								
4.4.3 Conducted internal audit within the following three months of each FY	2/CC	Yes	Yes	No	No	Yes	N/A	No	No	Yes	Yes
4.4.4 Submitted internal audit report to City Corporation meeting and PCO	2/CC	No	No	No	No	Yes	No	No	No	No	No

N/A= Not Applicable

**Analysis:**

**4.4.1 Prepared financial statement within the following month of each FY**, accounts departments of all CC (5) prepared financial statements within a month closer of the fiscal year till FY 2015-16, among them accounts departments of RpCC & ChCC handed over financial statements to the internal audit committees.

**4.4.2 Disclosed financial statement at CC notice board**, none of the CC (5) disclosed financial statement of FY 2015-16 on their notice board till Q4, Y3.

**4.4.3 Conducted internal audit within three months of each FY**, RpCC completed internal audit only of FY 2015-16 accounts within three months closer of the fiscal year, while NCC and ChCC internal audit is still continuing till Q4, Y3. CoCC & GCC didn't initiate internal audit since beginning of the project in FY 2014-15.

**4.4.4 Submitted internal audit report to City Council meeting and PCO**, RpCC submitted internal audit report of FY 2015-16 along with summery findings to City Council meeting. None of the CC (5) submitted internal audit report to PCO till Q4, Y3.

**Activity 4.5: Non-tax own revenue source increased at least by inflation rate in each year**

Sub-activity/Task	Target till Q-4, Y-3	NCC		CoCC		RpCC		GCC		ChCC	
		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress	
		Till Q-3, Y-3	In Q-4, Y-3								
4.5.1 Updated annual plan for non-tax revenue collection	3/CC	Yes	Yes								
4.5.2 Monitored monthly progress implementation of updated non-tax revenue collection plan	36/CC	Yes	Yes								
4.5.3 Reviewed updated non-tax revenue collection status every month by CEO/Secretary	36/CC	Yes	Yes								
4.5.4 Reviewed progress of other non-tax revenue <sup>25</sup> in the monthly meeting of CC	As req.	Yes	Yes	No	No	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes

N/A= Not Applicable

**Analysis:**

**4.5.1 Updated annual plan for non-tax revenue collection**, all CCs (5) updated their annual non-tax revenue collection plan for last 3 financial years.

**4.5.2 Monitored monthly progress implementation of updated non-tax revenue collection plan**, all CCs (5) monitored implementation progress of annual non-tax revenue plan every month till Q4, Y3.

**4.5.3 Reviewed updated non-tax revenue collection status every month by CEO/Secretary**, the CEO/Secretary of all CCs (5) reviewed non-tax revenue collection status every month till Q4, Y3.

**4.5.4 Reviewed progress of other non-tax revenue in City Council monthly meeting**, NCC, RpCC, GCC and ChCC reviewed progress of non-tax revenue collection status in their City Council meetings as was necessary till Q4, Y3, but CoCC did not review of non-tax revenue collection status in their CC meeting.

**Activity 4.6: All due debts to GOB and other entities fully repaid according the schedule**

Sub-activity/Task	Target till Q-4, Y-3	NCC		CoCC		RpCC		GCC		ChCC	
		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress	
		Till Q-3, Y-3	In Q-4, Y-3								
4.6.1 Reviewed documents related to all due debts of GOB and others	3/CC	Yes	N/A	N/A	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A

<sup>25</sup> Other non-tax revenues are lease, fees for markets; concession fees for bus/truck terminal, water tariff etc.

Sub-activity/Task	Target till Q-4, Y-3	NCC		CoCC		RpCC		GCC		ChCC	
		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress	
		Till Q-3, Y-3	In Q-4, Y-3								
4.6.2 Prepared budget provision for full repayment	3/CC	Yes	N/A	N/A	N/A	No	No	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A
4.6.3 Prepared quarterly repayment statement on all due debt and send to PCO	12/CC	Yes	No	N/A	N/A	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	No	No

N/A= Not Applicable

#### Analysis:

**4.6.1 Reviewed documents related to all due debts of GOB and others**, NCC, RpCC, GCC and ChCC reviewed documents related to all due debts of GOB and others for last three project years. CoCC did not receive such loan from any financier including GoB.

**4.6.2 Prepared budget provision for full repayment**, NCC, GCC and ChCC kept budget provision till FY 2016-17 for full repayment of due debts to GOB and other departments. RpCC didn't keep such budget provision for full repayment of due debts to GOB and other departments.

**4.6.3 Prepared quarterly repayment statement on all due debt and send to PCO**, out of 12 targeted quarterly repayment statements of each CC on all due debt, NCC prepared and sent total 4 repayment statements, RpCC 2 and GCC prepared and sent 5 repayment statements to PCO till Q4, Y3. Among the repayment statements, RpCC and GCC sent 4<sup>th</sup> quarter re-payment statement of FY 2016-17 to PCO on 16.7.2017 and 13.7.2017 respectively, but ChCC did not at all send any repayment statements to PCO till Q4, Y3.

#### Activity 4.7: Outstanding bills older than 3 months, including: I. electricity and II. Telephone, paid in time

Sub-activity/Task	Target till Q-4, Y-3	NCC		CoCC		RpCC		GCC		ChCC	
		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress	
		Till Q-3, Y-3	In Q-4, Y-3								
4.7.1 Ensured regular receipt of electricity and telephone bills	72/CC	Yes	Yes								
4.7.2 Settled dispute over arrear electricity and telephone bills	As required	N/A	N/A	No	No	No	No	N/A	N/A	No	Yes
4.7.3 Provisioned in annual budget for electricity and telephone bill payment	3/CC	Yes	N/A								
4.7.4 Paid electricity and telephone bill regularly	72/CC	Yes	Yes								
4.7.5 Reviewed progress of bill payment in CC monthly meeting	72/CC	Yes	No	Yes	No	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes

N/A= Not Applicable

**4.7.1 Ensured regular receipt of electricity and telephone bills**, all CCs (5) receipt targeted 72 electricity and telephone bills each regularly till Q4, Y3.

**4.7.2 Settled dispute over arrear electricity and telephone bills**, ChCC settled disputes over arrear street light electricity bill issue and made partial payment of BDT 12,311,294/= on 22.6.2017 and other than disputed street light rest electricity bills are paid regularly till end of FY 2016-17. CoCC and RpCC did not settle arrear water supply and street light electricity bill issues amounting of BDT 17,223,295/= and 80,000,000/= (of Pourashava period) respectively till Q4, Y3.

**4.7.3 Provisioned in budget for electricity and telephone bill payment**, all CCs (5) kept budget provision for payment of electricity and telephone bills till FY 2016-17.

**4.7.4 Paid electricity and telephone bill regularly**, all CCs (5) paid electricity and telephone bills regularly till Q4, Y3, *other than disputed arrear electricity bills of CoCC, RpCC and ChCC.*

**4.7.5 Reviewed progress of bill payment in CC monthly meeting**, the CEOs/Secretaries of RpCC, GCC and ChCC (3) presented progress of monthly electricity and telephone bill payment status in City Council monthly meetings for review till Q4, Y3. *The CEOs/Secretaries of NCC & CoCC did not present electricity and telephone bill payment status in their monthly council meeting for review in Q4, rather they presents need base.*

**Activity 4.8: Budget proposal is compared with the budget and actual outlays in the previous year, displayed at the CC office**

Sub-activity/Task	Target till Q-4, Y-3	NCC		CoCC		RpCC		GCC		ChCC	
		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress	
		Till Q-3, Y-3	In Q-4, Y-3								
4.8.1 Prepared draft budget proposal in accordance with the budget and actual outlays of the previous year	3/CC	Yes	Yes								
4.8.2 Obtained comments/suggestions on draft budget (disclosed and displayed) from citizens and CSCCs	3/ CC	Yes	Yes								
4.8.3 Finalized and approved budget in City Council meeting	3/CC	Yes	Yes								

N/A= Not Applicable

**Analysis:**

**4.8.1 Prepared draft budget proposal in accordance with the budget and actual outlays of the previous year**, all CCs (5) prepared draft budget proposals for FY 2017-18 in accordance with the budget and actual outlays of FY 2016-17 in Q4, Y3.

**4.8.2 Obtained comments/suggestions on draft budget (disclosed and displayed) from citizens and CSCCs**, NCC, CoCC and ChCC (3) had pre-budget discussion session on draft budget of FY 2017-18 and received comments/suggestions from citizens and CSCC in Q4, Y3. *RpCC and GCC did not receive comments/suggestions from citizens.*

**4.8.3 Finalized and approved budget in CC meeting**, all CCs (5) finalized and approved FY 2017-18 annual budgets in their city council meetings, during Q4, Y3.

**Area 5: Citizen’s Awareness and Participation**

**Activity 5.1: Civil Society Coordination Committee (CSCC) (T7)**

Sub-activity/Task	Target till Q-4, Y-3	NCC		CoCC		RpCC		GCC		ChCC	
		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress	
		Till Q-3, Y-3	In Q-4, Y-3								
5.1.1 Established CSCC <sup>26</sup> in accordance with composition and ToR	1/CC	Yes	N/A	Yes	Yes	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A
5.1.2 Assist, supervise and monitor the progress of CCIDP implementation according to guidelines	When req.	Yes	Yes	Yes	No	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
5.1.3 Sector-wide working group facilitated need identification and	When req.	No	No								

<sup>26</sup> Comprises of Mayor, CEO, CC officials who are in-charge of the topic of the specific CSCC meeting, representative of relevant Standing Committees, professional groups, civil societies/NGOs, private sectors (agriculture, processing and commercial industries), women, urban poor/CBO representatives, and additional member(s) or guest by Mayor’s appointment.

Sub-activity/Task	Target till Q-4, Y-3	NCC		CoCC		RpCC		GCC		ChCC	
		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress	
		Till Q-3, Y-3	In Q-4, Y-3								
prioritization											
5.1.4 Obtained approval of CAP from CC	As req.	No	No	No	No	No	No	Yes	N/A	No	No
5.1.5 CSCC quarterly general meeting	12/CC	Yes	Yes								
5.1.6 Identified women citizen's role in solving CC related problem/ issue	When req.	No	No								
5.1.7 Took appropriate & effective decisions for increasing revenue income	When req.	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	No
5.1.8 Discussion on problems & suggestions that identified in the Ward Level Coordination Committee (WLCC) and find out the ways and means to mitigate the problems	When req.	No	No								
5.1.9 Prepared proposals for advocacy for urban policy reform	When req.	No	No								
5.1.10 Gave necessary recommendations on CC proposed budget for next year	When req.	Yes	Yes								
5.1.11 Recorded CSCC meeting decisions and follow-up action/ status of implementation	When req.	Yes	Yes								

N/A= Not Applicable

#### Analysis:

**5.1.1 Established CSCC in accordance with composition and ToR**, all CCs (5) established CSCC in accordance with composition and ToR before Q2, Y3; NCC & CoCC re-established CSCCs after sitting new elected City Council in Q3, Y3. Among the CCs, NCC, CoCC, ----, introduced CSCC 2<sup>nd</sup> phase ToR in Q3, Y3, Q4, Y3 respectively; *but RpCC, GCC and ChCC did not introduce CSCC 2nd phase ToR till Q4, Y3.*

**5.1.2 Assist, supervise and monitor the progress of CCIDP implementation according to guidelines**, all CSCCs (5) at CC levels used to provide necessary assistance, supervision and progress monitoring support in implementing City Corporation's Infrastructure Development Plan (CCIDP) till Q4, Y3, *but CSCC at CoCC could not perform such responsibilities because of its re-establishment during the quarter.*

**5.1.3 Sector-wide working group facilitated need identification and prioritization**, *none of the Sector-wide Working Group at CC levels facilitated physical work need identification and prioritization till Q4, Y3.*

**5.1.4 Obtained approval of CAP from CC**, Civil Society Coordination Committee (CSCC) of GCC obtained approval of all (10) CAPs from City Council in Q2, Y3. *Rest CSCCs (4) did not obtain approval of CAP till Q4, Y3.*

**5.1.5 CSCC quarterly general meeting**, out of targeted 12 CSCC quarterly general meeting each, CSCC of NCC held 7 meeting, CoCC 6, RpCC 8, GCC 8 and CSCC of ChCC held 9 meetings till Q4, Y3. Among the CSCC meetings, NCC held 1 (4.5.2017), CoCC 1 (20.6.2017), RpCC 1 (6.6.2017), GCC 1 (12.6.2017) and ChCC held 1 meeting (15.6.2017) in Q4, Y3.

**5.1.6 Identified women citizen's role in solving CC related problem/ issue**, *none of the CSCCs (5) identified women citizen's role in solving CC related problems till Q4, Y3.*

**5.1.7 Took appropriate & effective decisions for increasing revenue income**, CSCCs (5) at all CC took decisions in different occasions to identify missing holdings, tax re-assessment, tax rebate, organize tax fair, raise citizen awareness, increase tax collectors, skill development training for tax section staff, introduce computer based tax accounting system etc. for increasing revenue income till Q4, Y3, *but CSCC at ChCC did not take such decisions in Q4, Y3.*

**5.1.8 Discussion on problems & suggestions that identified in the Ward Level Coordination Committee (WLCC) and find out the ways and means to mitigate the problems, none of the CSCC (5) discussed any problems & suggestions that are identified in WLCCs till Q4, Y3.**

**5.1.9 Prepared proposals for advocacy for urban policy reform, none of the CSCC (5) prepared proposal for advocacy for urban policy reform till Q4, Y3.**

**5.1.10 Gave necessary recommendations on CC proposed budget for next year, all CSCCs (5) provided necessary recommendations on CC proposed annual budgets for FY 2017-18 in Q4, Y3.**

**5.1.11 Recorded CSCC meeting decisions and follow-up action/status of implementation, all CSCCs (5) meetings decisions & actions are recorded and followed-up action/status of implementation of the decisions in the subsequent meetings till Q4, Y3.**

**Activity 5.2: Establishment of Ward Level Coordination Committee (WLCC) (T8)**

Sub-activity/Task	Target till Q-4, Y-3	NCC		CoCC		RpCC		GCC		ChCC	
		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress	
		Till Q-3, Y-3	In Q-4, Y-3								
5.2.1 Established Ward Level Coordination Committees (WLCCs) in each ward	1/ Ward	Yes	N/A	Yes	No	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A
5.2.2 Arranged WLCC meeting	6/ Ward	Yes	Yes	Yes	No	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
5.2.3 Reviewed progress of civil works (quality and problems)	As req.	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	Yes	No
5.2.4 Presented progress of civil works in CSCC meeting (through ward councilors)	As req.	No	No								
5.2.5 Conducted awareness raising activity for payment of tax and user charges of the Ward	As req.	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	No	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
5.2.6 Involved implementation and management of WASH, SW, street light etc.	As req.	Yes	Yes								
5.2.7 Arranged quarterly open discussion meeting on overall activities (inviting 150 citizens)	12/ Ward	No	No								

N/A= Not Applicable, NtR= Need to re-establish

**Analysis:**

**5.2.1 Established Ward Level Coordination Committees (WLCCs) in each ward, ward level coordination committees in each ward under targeted CCs (5) are established before Q2, Y3. NCC re-established in Q3, Y3 and CoCC did not re-establish after sitting new elected City Council in Q4, Y3.**

**5.2.2 Arranged WLCC meeting, at NCC out of minimum targeted 162 meetings in 27 wards held total 216 WLCC meetings; at CoCC out of 162 in 27 wards held 189 meetings; at RpCC out of 198 in 33 wards held 264 meetings; at GCC out of 342 in 57 wards held 342 meetings; and at ChCC out of minimum targeted 246 in 41 wards held total 193 WLCC meetings till Q4, Y3. Among the meetings NCC held 27, RpCC 33, GCC 57 and at ChCC in 11 ward held 11 WLCC meetings during the quarter, but at CoCC did not hold any WLCC meeting in any (27) wards due to last CC election and ChCC did not hold meeting in 30 wards in Q4, Y3**

**5.2.3 Reviewed progress of civil works (quality and problems), none of the WLCC (5) reviewed civil works progress till Q4, Y3.**

**5.2.4 Presented progress of civil works in CSCC meeting (through ward councilors), none of Ward Councilors on behalf of WLCC presented civil works progress in CSCC meetings till Q4, Y3.**

**5.2.5 Conducted awareness raising activity for payment of tax and user charges of the Ward, WLCCs** conducted casual awareness raising activity at ward level for raising payment of tax and user charges till Q4, Y3, *but nothing is in organized way.*

**5.2.6 Involved implementation and management of WASH, SW, and Street Light etc.** WLCCs are partly involved in implementation and management of WASH, SW and Street Light till Q4, Y3, *not as per project guidelines.*

**5.2.7 Arranged quarterly open discussion meeting on overall activities (inviting 150 citizens), none of the WLCC in any CC (5) arranged open discussion meeting inviting 150 citizens on overall ward level activities, including budget allocation from CC and peoples demand till Q4, Y3.**

**Activity 5.3: Integration of Community and Formation of Community Group (CG)**

Sub-activity/Task	Target till Q-4, Y-3	NCC		CoCC		RpCC		GCC		ChCC	
		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress	
		Till Q-3, Y-3	In Q-4, Y-3								
5.3.1 Conducted workshop <sup>27</sup> on concept and implementation of CG activity according to the PCO guideline	1/CC	No	No								
5.3.2 Selected target wards for waste collection pilot activity	As req.	Yes	N/A								
5.3.3 provided training to CG members on management & implementation of activities	1 Cr. /CC	No	No								
5.3.4 Reviewed the activities of waste collection and other social issues	As req.	No	No								
5.3.5 Conducted training for CG on 3R	1 Cr./CC	No	No								
5.3.6 Review 3R activities by CG	As req.	No	No								
5.3.7 Formed community base organization (CBO) in the core area of pilot wards	As req.	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	No	No	No	No	Yes	N/A

N/A= Not Applicable, Cr. = Course

**Analysis:**

**5.3.1 Conducted workshop on concept and implementation of CG activity according to the PCO guideline, none of the CC (5) conducted workshop on “Concept and Implementation of CG Activity” for local leaders/elites, professionals, councilors, relevant CC officials till Q4, Y3.**

**5.3.2 Selected target wards for waste collection pilot activity, NCC selected Ward-15, CoCC Ward-15, RpCC Ward-24, GCC Ward-43 and ChCC selected Ward-15 for waste collection pilot activities in Q2, Y3.**

**5.3.3 Provided training to CG members on management & implementation of activities, none of the CC (5) provided training to CG members on “Management & Implementation of Pilot Activities”, till Q4, Y3.**

**5.3.4 Reviewed the activities of waste collection and other social issues, none of the CC (5) reviewed waste collection activities and other social issues of pilot wards till Q4, Y3.**

**5.3.5 Conducted training for CG on 3R, none of the CC (5) conducted training on “3R” for CG/CBO members till Q4, Y3.**

<sup>27</sup> participants are (at least 30-35 persons) local leaders, local elites/different professionals, male and female ward councilors, relevant officers of CC and Mayor also may be invited in the workshop.

**5.3.6 Review 3R activities by CG**, none of the Community groups/organizations reviewed 3R activities in any CCs till Q4, Y3.

**5.3.7 Formed community base organization (CBO) in the core area of pilot wards**, NCC, CoCC, and ChCC form/select CGs/CBOs in selected pilot wards to perform waste collection activities in Q3, Y3. RpCC & GCC did not form/select CGs/CBOs in selected pilot ward.

**Activity 5.4: Gender action plan (GAP) prepared**

Sub-activity/Task	Target till Q-4, Y-3	NCC		CoCC		RpCC		GCC		ChCC	
		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress	
		Till Q-3, Y-3	In Q-4, Y-3								
5.4.1 Prepared Gender Action Plan (GAP)	1/CC	No	No	No	No	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	No	No
5.4.2 GAP endorsed by CSCC	1/CC	No	No	No	No	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	No	No
5.4.3 GAP approved by CC meeting	1/CC	No	No	No	No	No	Yes	No	No	No	No
5.4.4 Assigned officer to perform secretarial work for the Women Development Standing Committee	1/CC	Yes	N/A								
5.4.5 CC allocated budget for GAP implementation	3/CC	No	No	Yes	N/A	No	No	No	No	No	No
5.4.6 Prepared quarterly and annual report	12/CC 3/CC	No	No								

N/A= Not Applicable

**Analysis:**

**5.4.1 Prepared Gender Action Plan (GAP)**, Women Development Standing Committee at RpCC and GCC each produced (not as per PCO guideline) Gender Action Plan in Q3, Y3, but none of the rest (3) Women Development Standing Committee prepared Gender Action Plan.

**5.4.2 GAP endorsed by CSCC**, CSCC at RpCC and GCC endorsed Gender Action Plans in Q3, Y3, but CSCC at NCC, CoCC and ChCC did not endorse GAP, because it is not prepared and presented for endorsement till Q4, Y3.

**5.4.3 GAP approved by CC meeting**, CC meeting at RpCC approved GAP on 11.4.2017, rest (4) are not till Q4, Y3.

**5.4.4 Assigned officer to perform secretarial work of the Women Development Standing Committee**, all CCs (5) assigned officer to perform secretarial work of the Women Development Standing Committee before Q2, Y3 and continuing till Q4, Y3.

**5.4.5 CC allocated budget for GAP implementation**, only CoCC allocated budget for GAP implementation in FY 2016-17 which is ridiculous! Since CoCC doesn't have GAP. Rest CCs (NCC, RpCC, GCC and ChCC) did not allocate budget for GAP implementation till Q4, Y3.

**5.4.6 Prepared quarterly and annual reports**, WDSC of RpCC prepared only 4<sup>th</sup> quarter GAP implementation progress report on 21.5.2017, rest none prepared GAP implementation quarterly and annual progress report till Q4, Y3.

**Activity 5.5: Poverty reduction action plan (PRAP) prepared and implemented with inclusion of slum**

Sub-activity/Task	Target till Q-4, Y-3	NCC		CoCC		RpCC		GCC		ChCC	
		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress	
		Till Q-3, Y-3	In Q-4, Y-3								
5.5.1 Established steering committee as per composition <sup>28</sup>	1/CC	Yes	No	Yes	No	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A
5.5.2 Task Team (Micro Credit)	1/CC	Yes	N/A								
5.5.3 Task Team (Education & Health)	1/CC	Yes	N/A								
5.5.4 Task Team (Physical Work)	1/CC	Yes	N/A								
5.5.5 Officials (Slum Development officer) are assigned for facilitating poverty reduction standing committee's activities	1/CC	Yes	N/A	Yes	Yes	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A
5.5.6 Prepared PRAP by poverty reduction standing committee with budget	1/CC	No	No	No	No	No	No	Yes	N/A	No	No
5.5.7 Held workshop <sup>29</sup> on PRAP guideline	1/CC	Yes	N/A								
5.5.8 PRAP revised and endorsed by CSCC	As req.	No	No								
5.5.9 PRAP approved by CC meeting	1/CC	No	No								
5.5.10 Selected and approved slum	10/CC	Yes	N/A								
5.5.11 Formed primary female user group	150/CC	Yes	N/A								
5.5.12 Established mother and child care services	10/CC	Yes	N/A								
5.5.13 Established satellite school service	10/CC	Yes	N/A								
5.5.14 Established saving, credit and IGAs	10/CC	Yes	Yes								
5.5.15 Provided training on IGAs	As req.	No	No								
5.5.16 Provided small infrastructure development services	As feas. /CC	No	Yes								
5.5.17 Prepared annual report	3/CC	No	No								

N/A= Not Applicable, Feas. = Feasible

**Analysis:**

**5.5.1 Established Steering Committee as per composition**, all CCs (5) established Steering Committees to guide PRAP implementation before Q2, Y3, *but NCC & CoCC need to re-establish after sitting new council.*

**5.5.2 Task Team (Micro Credit)**, all CCs (5) established task team to guide micro credit implementation under PRAP, before Q2, Y3, *but not functional.*

**5.5.3 Task Team (Education & Health)**, all CCs (5) established task team to guide Education & Health implementation under PRAP, before Q2, Y3, *but not functional.*

<sup>28</sup> Comprises of Mayor, Chairperson of Standing Committee for Poverty Reduction and Slum Development, male and female ward councilors, CEO, Chief Engineer, Health Officer, Accounts Officer, Education Officer/ Officer in Charge, Slum Development Officer/ Officer in Charge, Conservancy Officer, and Secretary.

<sup>29</sup> Workshop participants are CC officials and agencies involved in the poverty reduction activities like Social Welfare Cooperative, NGOs, Ansar/ VDP, LGED etc.

**5.5.4 Task Team (physical work)**, all CCs (5) established task team to guide physical work implementation under PRAP, before Q2, Y3, *but not functional*.

**5.5.5 Officials (Slum Development officer) are assigned for facilitating standing committee's activities**, all CCs (5) assigned officials (Slum Development officer) to facilitate Poverty Reduction Standing Committee activities before Q2, Y3. NCC and CoCC re-assigned in Q3, Y3 and Q4, Y3 respectively after sitting new elected city council.

**5.5.6 Prepared PRAP by poverty reduction standing committee with budget**, Poverty Reduction and Slum Development Standing Committee at GCC prepared PRAP with budget, not as per PCO guideline before Q2, Y3, *rest (4) none prepared PRAP till Q4, Y3*.

**5.5.7 Held workshop on PRAP guideline**, all CCs (5) organized workshop on "PRAP guideline" only with CC officials before Q2, Y3, *but officials of other agencies involved in similar activities and LGED were not invited in the workshop*.

**5.5.8 PRAP revised and endorsed by CSCC**, *none of the CSCC at CCs (5) endorsed revise PRAP till Q4, Y3*.

**5.5.9 PRAP approved by CC meeting**, *none of city council meeting approved PRAP till Q4, Y3*.

**5.5.10 Selected and approved slum**, all city councils (5) approved selected 10 slums each for PRAP implementation before Q2, Y3.

**5.5.11 Formed primary female user group**, each CC (5) formed 30 primary female user groups in each CC before Q2, Y3.

**5.5.12 Established mother and child care services**, each CC (5) introduced mother and child care services in selected slums before Q2, Y3 and continuing till Q4, Y3.

**5.5.13 Established satellite school service**, each CC (5) started pre-primary education services in selected slums before Q2, Y3 continuing till Q4, Y3.

**5.5.14 Established saving, credit and IGAs**, each primary female user groups started weekly saving program before Q2, Y3, but credit and IGA started in Q4, Y3.

**5.5.15 Provided training on IGAs**, *none of the CC provided need based IGA training to beneficiaries till Q4, Y3*.

**5.5.16 Provided small infrastructure development services**, all CCs (5) started to provide small infrastructure development services in approved slums in Q4, Y3.

**5.5.17 Prepared annual report**, *none of the poverty reduction standing committee at CCs (5) prepared annual progress reports till Q4, Y3*.

**Activity 5.6: Revision of citizen charter**

Sub-activity/Task	Target till Q-4, Y-3	NCC		CoCC		RpCC		GCC		ChCC	
		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress	
		Till Q-3, Y-3	In Q-4, Y-3								
5.6.1 Assigned working group/officer in charge for preparation/revision of the citizen charter	1/CC	Yes	N/A								
5.6.2 Revised citizen charter approved by CSCC	2/CC	Yes	N/A	Yes	No	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A
5.6.3 Revised citizen charter annually	1/CC	N/A	N/A	Yes	No	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A
5.6.4 Displayed citizen charter	3/CC	Yes	N/A	Yes	No	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A

N/A= Not Applicable

**Analysis:**

**5.6.1 Assigned working group/officer in charge for preparation/revision of the citizen charter, NCC** assigned officer in-charge, ----- on 7.4.2016, CoCC assigned officer in-charge, ---- on 14.6.2016, RpCC assigned working group comprises of CEO, Town Planner and Senior Programmer on 25.4.2016, GCC ----- on ---- and ChCC assigned officer in-charge, ---- on 20.4.2016 for preparation/revision of the Citizen Charter.

**5.6.2 Revised citizen charter approved by CSCC, CSCCs** at NCC, RpCC, GCC and ChCC discussed and approved revised Citizen Charter in their meeting on 29.9.2016, 25.4.2017, 29.9.2016 and --/--/-- respectively, *but CSCC at CoCC didn't discuss and approve revised Citizen Charter in FY 2016-17.*

**5.6.3 Revised citizen charter annually, NCC, RpCC, GCC and ChCC** revised their citizen charter for FY 2016-17, *but CoCC didn't revise Citizen Charter.*

**5.6.4 Displayed citizen charter, NCC, RpCC, GCC and ChCC** disclosed revised citizen charter through display, booklet, local newspaper and website in FY 2016-17, *but CoCC didn't display revised citizen charter.*

**Activity 5.7: Citizen report cards prepared, approved and implemented by CSCC**

Sub-activity/Task	Target till Q-4, Y-3	NCC		CoCC		RpCC		GCC		ChCC	
		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress	
		Till Q-3, Y-3	In Q-4, Y-3	Till Q-3, Y-3	In Q-4, Y-3	Till Q-3, Y-3	Till Q-3, Y-3	In Q-4, Y-3	Till Q-3, Y-3	In Q-4, Y-3	Till Q-3, Y-3
5.7.1 Assigned 3 members task team <sup>30</sup> to organize citizen report card survey	1/CC	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A
5.7.2 Task team/WG to prepared citizen report card	1/CC	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A
5.7.3 Conducted minimum 500 questionnaire surveys	2/CC	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A
5.7.4 Discussed draft CRC report and recommendation taken from CSCC	2/CC	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	Yes	No	No
5.7.5 Compiled the result and disclose at least twice within phase-2	1/CC	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No

*N/A= Not Applicable*

**Analysis:**

**5.7.1 Assigned 3 members task team to organize citizen report card survey, this is not task of the Q4,** all CCs (5) formed 3 members task team and assigned to organize citizen report card survey before Q2, Y3, *but none of task team was actively involved in citizen report card survey.*

**5.7.2 Task team/WG to prepared citizen report card, this is not task of the Q4, but earlier none of Task Team/Working Group prepared Citizen Report Card rather GICD prepared and sent to City Corporation to conduct survey during Q2, Y3.**

**5.7.3 Conducted minimum 500 questionnaire survey, this is not task of the Q4, each CC (5) carried out citizen report card survey with 100 holdings instead of 500 in Q3, Y3.**

**5.7.4 Discussed draft CRC report and recommendation taken from CSCC, Senior Slum Development Officer (SDO), GCC reported that draft CRC report was discussed in CSCC meeting on 5.6.2017, but no documentary evidence found in regards to presenter and ultimate any recommendation of CSCC to finalized CRC report, while other CSCCs didn't discuss CRC report in their meeting till Q4, Y3.**

**5.7.5 Compiled the result and disclose at least twice within phase-2, Junior Facilitators reported that CRC survey report were compiled by GICD specialists but copies were not available at CCs and Task**

<sup>30</sup> Comprises of the 3 members assigned by Mayor

Team/Working Group are not aware about compilation of the CRC report, while none of the Task Team/Working Group disclosed CRC survey result till Q4, Y3.

**Activity 5.8: Grievance -redress cell (GRC) established with revised terms of reference and functional**

Sub-activity/Task	Target till Q-4, Y-3	NCC		CoCC		RpCC		GCC		ChCC	
		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress	
		Till Q-3, Y-3	In Q-4, Y-3								
5.8.1 Assigned official to set the GRC	1/CC	Yes	N/A	Yes	No	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A
5.8.2 Established Grievance Redress Cell at CC office.	1/CC	Yes	N/A	Yes	No	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A
5.8.3 Held one or more GRC meeting every month along with APs	As req.	No	No								
5.8.4 Invited potential complaints in the GRC and held meeting if require	As req.	No	No								
5.8.5 Kept record of all Grievances	As req.	No	No								
5.8.6 Presented grievance redress agenda in City Corporation meeting for taking appropriate action	As req.	No	No								

N/A= Not Applicable

**Analysis:**

**5.8.1 Assigned official to set the GRC**, all CCs (5) assigned officer in-charge to set the GRC before Q2, Y3, but CoCC need to re-assign officer in charge due to recent past city council election held during Q3, Y3.

**5.8.2 Established Grievance Redress Cell at CC office**, all CCs (5) established Grievance Redress Cell as per CGP guideline before Q2, Y3 but not functioning, other project established GRCs are supplementing functions. CoCC need to re-establish GRC due to recent past city council election held during Q3, Y3.

**5.8.3 Held one or more GRC meeting every month along with APs**, all CCs (5) held need based GRC meetings, but no GRC meeting held during Q4, Y3, since there is no compensation provision in CGP and need of GRC regular meeting.

**5.8.4 Invited potential complaints in the GRC and held meeting, if require**, no evidence of inviting potentials complaints observed in any City Corporation during till Q4, Y3.

**5.8.5 Kept record of all Grievances**, no evidence observed of maintaining register, meeting notice, meeting minutes etc. for keeping records of all grievances till Q4, Y3.

**5.8.6 Presented grievance redress agenda in City Corporation meeting for taking appropriate action**, no documentary evidence found of presenting grievance redress agenda in CC meeting for taking appropriate action till Q4, Y3.

**Area 6: Urban Planning and Environment Improvement**

**Activity 6.1: Initiate/update master plan**

Sub-activity/Task	Target till Q-4, Y-3	NCC		CoCC		RpCC		GCC		ChCC	
		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress	
		Till Q-3, Y-3	In Q-4, Y-3								
6.1.1 Available master plan (including drainage, traffic &	1/CC	Yes	N/A								

transportation, land use, solid waste management etc.											
6.1.2 Available detailed area plan	1/CC	Yes	N/A								
6.1.3 Available action plan for infrastructure and public facilities	1/CC	No	Yes	No							
6.1.4 Assigned officer in charge <sup>31</sup> for each plan	3/CC	No	Yes	No							
6.1.5 Established committee for each plan <sup>32</sup>	3/CC	No									

N/A= Not Applicable

### Analysis:

#### 6.1.1 Available master plan (including drainage, traffic & transportation, land use, solid waste management etc. this is not task of the Q4

- Dhaka Metropolitan Development Plan (DMDP), 1995-2015, RAJUK included part of Narayanganj and Gazipur
- ChCC Metropolitan Master Plan, 1995-2015, CDA
- Narayanganj Action Area Plan (AAP), 2016-2021, LGED for extended part
- Gazipur Action Area Plan (AAP), 2016-2021, LGED for extended part
- Comilla City Corporation Master Plan, 2014-2034, LGED; and
- Rangpur City Corporation Master Plan, 2014-2034, LGED are already prepared and available including drainage, traffic & transportation, land use, solid waste management etc.

Among them, Narayanganj & Gazipur Action Area Plans (AAPs) and Comilla & Rangpur City Corporation Master Plans are submitted to LGD for approval long ago.

#### 6.1.2 Available detailed area plan, this is not task of the Q4, Detail Area Plan (DAP) for Dhaka, 2010-2015, RAJUK included part of Narayanganj and Gazipur, those are now under revision; and the City Corporation Master Plan of Rangpur, Comilla, and Chittagong included Detail Area Plan (DAP).

#### 6.1.3 Available action plan for infrastructure and public facilities, none of the CC prepared their Action Plan for infrastructure and public facilities based on Master Plan till Q4, Y3.

#### 6.1.4 Assigned officer in charge for each plan, only NCC assigned Md. Moinul Islam, Urban Planner on 30.4.2017 for implementation, supervision and monitoring of structure plan, detail area plan, revised strategic transport plan-2035, and action area plan. None of the rest CCs assigned officer in charge for each plan (drainage, traffic & transportation, land use, solid waste management etc.) till Q4, Y3

#### 6.1.5 Established committee for each plan, none of the CC established committee for each (drainage, traffic & transportation, land use, solid waste management etc.) infrastructure and public facilities plan till Q4, Y3.

### Activity 6.2: Development control implemented (T9)

Sub-activity/Task	Target till Q-4, Y-3	NCC		CoCC		RpCC		GCC		ChCC	
		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress	
		Till Q-3, Y-3	In Q-4, Y-3								
6.2.1 Assigned at least one qualified officer in charge for building permission	1/CC	Yes	N/A								
6.2.2 Defined signatory for application procedure	1/CC	Yes	N/A								
6.2.3 Identified illegal buildings	As req.	No	Yes	No	Yes	No	Yes	No	Yes	No	No

<sup>31</sup> Officer in charge of CSCC, CDCC, and RAJUK/ CDC only in NCC, GCC & ChCC

<sup>32</sup> Plans are drainage, traffic & transportation, land use, solid waste management etc.

Sub-activity/Task	Target till Q-4, Y-3	NCC		CoCC		RpCC		GCC		ChCC	
		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress	
		Till Q-3, Y-3	In Q-4, Y-3								
6.2.4 Taken any action for illegal buildings	As req.	No	Yes	No	Yes	No	Yes	No	Yes	No	No

N/A= Not Applicable

**Analysis:**

**6.2.1 Assigned at least one qualified officer in charge for building permission**, this is not task of the Q4, all CCs (5) assigned one officer in-charge each for building permission before Q2, Y3.

**6.2.2 Defined signatory for application procedure**, this is not task of the Q4, all CCs (5) defined signatory for application procedure before Q2, Y3.

**6.2.3 Identified illegal buildings**, NCC identified 9 illegal buildings (residential and commercial), CoCC 131, RpCC 28 and GCC identified 41 illegal buildings ) in their territory in Q4, Y3, *but ChCC did not identify such buildings, because building permission authority belongs to CDA.*

**6.2.4 Taken any action for illegal buildings**, NCC informed RAJUK for necessary action against identified illegal buildings; CoCC, RpCC and GCC warned owners to demolish illegal portion of the buildings in Q4, Y3.

**Activity 6.3: Practical use of City Corporation Infrastructure Development Plan (CCIDP)**

Sub-activity/Task	Target till Q-4, Y-3	NCC		CoCC		RpCC		GCC		ChCC	
		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress	
		Till Q-3, Y-3	In Q-4, Y-3								
6.3.1 Published CCIDP in website or print copy for citizen access	1/CC/year	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	No
6.3.2 Shared revise CCIDP in CDCC by 2nd quarter each year	2/CC	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	No
6.3.3 Approved revise CCI DP by CC Parishad	2/CC	Yes	No	Yes	No	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	No
6.3.4 Approached to financial supporters to promote CCIDP	As req.	Yes	No								

N/A= Not Applicable

**Analysis:**

**6.3.1 Published CCIDP in website or print copy for citizen access** (task of Q2), all CCs (5) prepared and published CCIDP for batch-1 sub-projects in their website or print copy for citizen access before Q2, Y3; and NCC, CoCC, RpCC and GCC (3) revise IDP including batch-2 sub-projects in Q4, Y3 instead of Q2, Y3, *ChCC did not revise and publish IDP.*

**6.3.2 Shared revise CCIDP in CDCC by 2<sup>nd</sup> quarter each year**, CDCCs at NCC, CoCC, RpCC and GCC (4) revised their CCIDP in Q4, Y3 including batch-2 sub-projects (on 19.6.2017, 20.6.2017, 27.4.2017 and 12.6.2017) instead of Q2, Y3, *but CDCC at ChCC did not share revise CCIDP including batch-2 sub-projects till Q4, Y3.*

**6.3.3 Approved revise CCIDP by CC Parishad** (task of Q2), CC Parishad at RpCC and GCC (2) approved revised CCIDP on (24.5.2016 and 22.6.2017) in Q4, Y3, *but CC Parishad at NCC, CoCC, and ChCC did not approve revise CCIDP.*

**6.3.4 Approached to financial supporters to promote CCIDP**, NCC approached to ADB, DPP, BMDF, UNDP, WB and GoB; CoCC to ADB, DPP, WB, UNDP and GoB; RpCC to DPP, BMDF, WB, UNDP and GoB; GCC to ADB, DPP, BMDF, UNICEF, WB and GoB; and ChCC approached to ADB, DPP, BMDF, WB and GoB for

financial supporter to promote CCIDP following planning discipline of the Bangladesh Government till Q4, Y3.

#### Activity 6.4: Establish O&M action plan

Sub-activity/Task	Target till Q-4, Y-3	NCC		CoCC		RpCC		GCC		ChCC	
		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress	
		Till Q-3, Y-3	In Q-4, Y-3								
6.4.1 Available approved O&M action plan from PCO	1/CC	Yes	No								
6.4.2 Implemented O&M action plan	0	No	No								

N/A= Not Applicable

#### Analysis:

**6.4.1 Available approved O&M action plan from PCO**, all CCs (5) prepared annual O & M action plan with budget provision once in Q3, Y2 for FY 2015-16 covering only for CGP constructed batch-1 roads and drains and obtained approval from PCO. *None of the CC prepared annual O&M plan for subsequent years till Q4, Y3.*

**6.4.2 Implemented O&M action plan**, reported that all CCs (5) will implement PCO approved annual O&M action plan prepared for FY 2015-16, soon after contractor's maintenance period is over/expire.

#### Activity 6.5: Environmental Conservation Act and Environment Framework (T10)

Sub-activity/Task	Target till Q-4, Y-3	NCC		CoCC		RpCC		GCC		ChCC	
		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress	
		Till Q-3, Y-3	In Q-4, Y-3								
6.5.1 Assigned officer(s) in charge of environmental conservation	1/CC	Yes	N/A								
6.5.2 Complied act and rules in its infrastructure development	As req.	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	N/A
6.5.3 Identified environmentally vulnerable areas and activities against Environmental Conservation Act	As req.	No	No								
6.5.4 Taken action to stop the illegal activities which are not relay with Environmental Conservation Act	As req.	No	No								

N/A= Not Applicable

#### Analysis:

**6.5.1 Assigned officer(s) in charge of environmental conservation**, all CCs (5) assigned officer in charge of environmental conservation before Q2, Y3 and single short task unless any change occur.

**6.5.2 Complied act and rules in its infrastructure development**, all CCs (5) obtained required environmental clearance/concurrence from Department of Environment (DoE) and JICA for all 55 sub-projects under batch-1 and 77 sub-projects under batch-2 by Q3, Y3.

**6.5.3 Identified environmentally vulnerable areas and activities against Environmental Conservation Act**, NCC and GCC identified a few rivers and industries as vulnerable activities in Q4, Y3, *but none of the CC (5) identified on the map environmentally vulnerable areas against environment conservation act till Q4, Y3.*

**6.5.4 Taken action to stop the illegal activities which are not relay with Environmental Conservation Act**, NCC issued notice to 42 individual owners to stop use of those vulnerable buildings, similar notice published in local newspaper and requested concerned utility service providers to stop

services in those identified living/commercial buildings in Q3, Y3. *But none of the CCs (5) took any action to stop the illegal activities which are not relay (vulnerable area and activity) with Environmental Conservation Act till Q4, Y4.*

### Activity 6.6: Sanitary Situation

Sub-activity/Task	Target till Q-4, Y-3	NCC		CoCC		RpCC		GCC		ChCC	
		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress	
		Till Q-3, Y-3	In Q-4, Y-3								
6.6.1 Assigned officer in charge of sanitation	1/CC	Yes	N/A								
6.6.2 Available situation analysis on overall sanitation condition	As req.	No	No								
6.6.3 Available demand analysis and area selection for public and household toilets	As req.	No	No								
6.6.4 Build public toilets	As req.	No	No								
6.6.5 Maintained and operate public toilets	As req.	Yes	Yes								
6.6.6 Facilitated household toilet installation	As req.	No	No								
6.6.7 Increased drainage connection for households' waste water	As req.	No	No								

N/A= Not Applicable

#### Analysis:

**6.6.1 Assigned officer in charge of sanitation**, all CCs (5) assigned officer in charge of sanitation before Q2, Y3 and single short task unless any change occur.

**6.6.2 Available situation analysis on overall sanitation condition**, *none of the CC (5) carried out/ updated situation analysis on overall sanitation condition till Q4, Y3.*

*Note that the national sanitation situation analysis carried out 2003 and/or carried out by any other project/agency by the time could be compiled and updated to make it compatible with present situation.*

**6.6.3 Available demand analysis and area selection for public and household toilets**, *none of the CC (5) analyzed present demand and area for public and household toilets till Q4, Y3. All CCs (5) prepared need lists of public toilets, which are not at all demand analysis.*

**6.6.4 Build public toilets**, *reported that RpCC constructed 7 public toilets from their own fund in Q3, Y3. But none constructed public toilets from CGP fund till Q4, Y3.*

**6.6.5 Maintained and operate public toilets**, all CCs (5) leased out existing public toilets given the responsibility of regular operation, maintenance and small repair to lease holders till Q4, Y3.

**6.6.6 Facilitated household toilet installation**, all CCs (5) initiated construction of shared latrine in selected slums from CGP and user family contribution in Q3, Y3. *But, none facilitated individual household toilet installation till Q4, Y3.*

**6.6.7 Increased drainage connection for household's waste water** reported that house owners by themselves established household waste water connection with CGP constructed drains, number not known in Q4, Y3, *but not by CCs.*

**Activity 6.7: Solid Waste Management (T11)**

Sub-activity/Task	Target till Q-4, Y-3	NCC		CoCC		RpCC		GCC		ChCC	
		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress	
		Till Q-3, Y-3	In Q-4, Y-3								
6.7.1 Assigned officers in charge for SWM, phase-1	1/CC	Yes	N/A								
6.7.2 Established solid waste management committee <sup>33</sup> (SWMC), phase-1	1/CC	No	No								
6.7.3 Prepared SWM plan, phase-1	1/CC	No	Yes	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No
6.7.4 Trained staff on SWM, phase-1	1/CC	No	No								
6.7.5 Signed agreement between CG and WLCC, phase-1	As req.	No	No								
6.7.6 Established primary waste collection system in collaboration with CBO/private sectors, phase-1	As req.	Yes	N/A								
6.7.7 Located dustbins, solid waste deposits and transfer station in collaboration with community, phase-1	As req.	Yes	N/A								
6.7.8 Coordinated to clean solid waste from road and drainage, phase-1	As req.	Yes	N/A								
6.7.9 Collected solid waste in wider area and dispose it into a specific dumping site, phase-2	As req.	Yes	N/A								
6.7.10 Initiated 3R piloting	As req.	No	No								

N/A= Not Applicable

**Analysis:**

**6.7.1 Assigned officers in charge for solid waste management, phase-1**, all CCs (5) assigned officers in charge for Solid Waste Management before Q2, Y3, single short task unless any change occur.

**6.7.2 Established solid waste management committee (SWMC), phase-1**, none of the CC established 7-9 members Solid Waste Management Committee with one representative from each community group (CG), male & female ward councilors and one CC official till Q4, Y3.

**6.7.3 Prepared solid waste management plan, phase-1**, none of the CC (5) prepared solid waste management plan as per PCO guideline till Q4, Y3.

**6.7.4 Trained staff for solid waste management, phase-1**, none of the CC (5) trained staff on solid waste management and community mobilization facilitator to promote leadership, even did not organize any public awareness and social mobilization activities as per PCO guideline till Q4, Y3.

**6.7.5 Signed agreement between CG and WLCC, phase-1**, no agreement signed between CG and WLCC for SWM at any CC till Q4, Y3.

**6.7.6 Established primary waste collection system in collaboration with CBO/private sectors, phase-1**, reported that all CCs (5) established primary waste collection system in as their tradition before Q2, Y3, not as per PCO guideline till Q4, Y3.

**6.7.7 Located dustbins, solid waste deposits and transfer station in collaboration with community, phase-1**, reported that all CCs (5) located dustbins, solid waste deposits and transfer station as their tradition before Q2, Y3, not as per PCO guideline till Q4, Y3.

<sup>33</sup> Comprises of (7 to 9 members) representatives from each community group (CG), male & female ward councilors and one CC official.

**6.7.8 Coordinated to clean solid waste from road and drainage, phase-1**, reported that all CCs (5) coordinates to clean solid waste from road and drainage in phase-1, as their tradition, *not as per PCO guideline till Q4, Y3*.

**6.7.9 Collected solid waste in wider area and dispose it into a specific dumping site, phase-2**, reported that all CCs (5) collects solid waste in wider area and disposes those into specific dumping site since phase-2 as their tradition. *None of the CC have designated dumping site as per PCO guideline till Q4, Y3*.

**6.7.10 Initiated 3R piloting**, *none of CC (5) initiated 3R piloting till Q4, Y3*.

## Area 7: Coordination System for Law Enforcement

### Activity 7.1: Awareness campaign for Rule of Law

Sub-activity/Task	Target till Q-4, Y-3	NCC		CoCC		RpCC		GCC		ChCC	
		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress	
		Till Q-3, Y-3	In Q-4, Y-3								
7.1.1 Assigned Law Officer	1/CC	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	Yes	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A
7.1.2 Prepared plans and budget for awareness campaign	3/CC	Yes	N/A								
7.1.3 Plans and budget approved by CC	3/CC	Yes	N/A								
7.1.4 Implemented campaign activity	3/CC	Yes	N/A								
7.1.5 Submitted report to Mayor & CEO	3/CC	Yes	N/A	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	N/A

N/A= Not Applicable

#### Analysis:

**7.1.1 Assigned Law Officer**, all CCs (5) assigned Law Officer before Q2, Y3, note that RpCC re-assigned Abu Sala Musa Md. Jangi, Secretary in Q4, Y3.

**7.1.2 Prepared plans and budget for awareness campaign**, all Law Officers prepared annual plans and budget for specific awareness campaign issue for FY 2015-16 and FY 2016-17.

**7.1.3 Plans and budget approved by CC**, all CCs (5) approved plans and budget presented by respective Law Officer on specific awareness campaign issue, incorporating necessary comment/revision suggested by Standing Committee for Law and Discipline for Y2 and Y3 (FY 2015-16 and FY 2016-17).

**7.1.4 Implemented campaign activity**, all Law Officers guided implementation of one awareness campaign activity each year on several selected issues (not specific) in FY 2015-16 and FY 2016-17, till Q4, Y3.

**7.1.5 Submitted report to Mayor & CEO**, all Law Officers prepared 1<sup>st</sup> awareness campaign report of Y2, furthermore, the Law Officer of RpCC and GCC prepared and submitted 2<sup>nd</sup> awareness campaign report to Mayor and CEO in Q4, Y3, also CoCC submitted the same report.

### Activity 7.2: Law Enforcement Unit (LEU) established (T12)

Sub-activity/Task	Target till Q-4, Y-3	NCC		CoCC		RpCC		GCC		ChCC	
		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress	
		Till Q-3, Y-3	In Q-4, Y-3								
7.2.1 Established Law Enforcement Unit (LEU) <sup>34</sup>	1/CC	Yes	Yes	Yes	No	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A

<sup>34</sup> LEU comprises of member of the Standing Committee on Law and Discipline, Magistrate (nominated by the Deputy Commissioner if the magistrate is not appointed in the CC), Police Officer (nominated by the Superintendent of Police preferably ASP), and Law Officer.

Sub-activity/Task	Target till Q-4, Y-3	NCC		CoCC		RpCC		GCC		ChCC	
		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress	
		Till Q-3, Y-3	In Q-4, Y-3								
7.2.2 Signed LEU circular by Mayor and distributed	1/CC	Yes	Yes	Yes	No	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A
7.2.3 Conducted workshop <sup>35</sup> on LEU guideline and activity	1/CC	No	No								
7.2.4 Prepared plans and budget for law enforcement	3/CC	No	Yes	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No
7.2.5 Conducted training <sup>36</sup> on law enforcement	1/CC	No	Yes	No	No	No	Yes	No	Yes	No	Yes
7.2.6 Implemented law enforcement activity	As req.	Yes	Yes								
7.2.7 Produced report on law enforcement	3/CC	No	Yes	No	No	No	No	No	Yes	No	No
7.2.8 Established trial court	As req.	Yes	No	Yes	No	Yes	No	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes

N/A= Not Applicable

### Analysis:

**7.2.1 Established Law Enforcement Unit (LEU)**, all CCs (5) established LEU before Q2, Y3. NCC re-established LEU in Q4, Y3 after last City Council election, while CoCC still need to re-establish LEU.

**7.2.2 Signed LEU circular by Mayor and distributed**, all Mayors (5) issued and distributed circular in regards to establishment of LEU before Q2, Y3. The Mayor, NCC re-issued circular of LEU re-establishment in Q4, Y3 after last City Council election, while CoCC not.

**7.2.3 Conducted workshop on LEU guideline and activity**, none of the CC (5) conducted workshop with LEU members on formation, objectives, ToR and tasks to be performed by LEU, till Q3, Y3.

**7.2.4 Prepared plans and budget for law enforcement**, NCC prepared only plan for law enforcement for FY 2017-18, and all CCs (5) kept block allocation in their FY 2017-18 budgets to perform law enforcement activities for the first time ever.

**7.2.5 Conducted training on law enforcement once a year**, LEU of NCC, RpCC, GCC and ChCC (4) organized training for members of Standing Committee for Law and Discipline and concerned officials on "Law Enforcement" during Q4, Y3 for the first time, dated 24.4.2017, 24.4.2017, 27.4.2017 and 3.5.2017 respectively. *The confusion prevails between workshop and training understanding, need immediate resolve.*

**7.2.6 Implemented law enforcement activity**, all CCs (5) implemented law enforcement activities though LEU such as commissioning mobile court, eviction of illegal occupants from footpaths, food adulteration, eviction of illegal occupants from CC owned land etc. as and when required till Q4, Y3.

**7.2.6 Produced report on law enforcement**, only LEU of NCC and GCC (2) produced report on law enforcement activities during Q4, Y3. *LEU of rest CCs (3) did not produced such report till Q4, Y3.*

**7.2.7 Established trial court**, all CCs (5) establishes trial court and functions when require. Among the CCs, GCC and ChCC commissioned trial court in Q4, Y3.

<sup>35</sup> Pparticipants of the workshop/seminar are elected representatives, members of the Standing Committees, Grievance Redress cell, Community Based Organization, elites of the city, concerned private organizations and journalists.

<sup>36</sup> The training needs to be given subject wise by the senior officials of the CC and the resource persons to LEU members.

**Activity 7.3: Capacity development for Standing Committee for Law and Discipline implemented (T13)**

Sub-activity/ Task	Target till Q-4, Y-3	NCC		CoCC		RpCC		GCC		ChCC	
		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress		Progress	
		Till Q-3, Y-3	In Q-4, Y-3								
7.3.1 Participated training on law enforcement	1/CC	No	Yes	No	No	No	Yes	No	Yes	No	Yes
7.3.2 Examined awareness campaign on law	3/CC	Yes	N/A								
7.3.3 Examined plan of law enforcement activities	3/CC	No	Yes	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No

N/A= Not Applicable

**Analysis:**

**7.3.1 Participated training on law enforcement**, NCC, RpCC, GCC and ChCC (4) concern officials and Standing Committee for Law and Discipline members participated in training on Law Enforcement in Q4, Y3. *CoCC concern officials and Standing Committee for Law and Discipline members didn't participate in training on Law Enforcement till Q4, Y3.*

**7.3.2 Examined awareness campaign on law**, Law Officers of all CCs (5) examined law related issues raised by their departments for FY 2016-17 before Q4, Y3.

**7.3.3 Examined plan of law enforcement activities**, only Law Officer of NCC examined plans of law enforcement activities during Q4, Y3. *Law Officer of rest CCs (4) did not examine such plan, since those are not prepared by LEU till Q4, Y3.*

**4.2 Component-2: Infrastructure Development**

**a) Physical and Financial progress by sub-projects and batches**

**Narayanganj City Corporation, Batch-1 sub-projects**

Package (#)	Progress (%)	
	Physical	Financial
NCCB1-01	94.50	85
NCCB1-02	100	88
NCCB1-03	100	88

**Analysis:**

**Under batch-1**, out of total 3, completed 100% physical works of **two packages** (2 & 3) followed by 88% payment progress and completed 94.5% civil works of remaining **one** package (1) followed by 85% payment progress till Q4, Y3.

**Narayanganj City Corporation, Batch-2 sub-projects**

Package (#)	Progress (%)	
	Physical	Financial
NCCB2-04	7	0
NCCB2-05	2	0
NCCB2-06	3	0

**Analysis:**

**Under batch-2**, out of total 12, started civil works of **three** packages (4, 5 & 6) and made 7%, 2% & 3% progress respectively; in addition, signed contracts for **two** packages (3 & 11) till Q4, Y3.

**Comilla City Corporation, Batch-1 sub-projects**

Package (#)	Progress (%)	
	Physical	Financial
CoCCB1-01	100	92
CoCCB1-02	100	96
CoCCB1-03	100	89
CoCCB1-04	100	92
CoCCB1-05	100	96
CoCCB1-06	100	91
CoCCB1-07	100	96
<b>CoCCB1-08</b>	<b>Implemented by other agency</b>	
CoCCB1-09	100	100

**Analysis:**

**Under batch-1, out of total 8,** completed 100% civil works of all packages (1-7 & 9) followed by final payment of 7 package (1, 2, 4, 5, 6, 7 and 9); and for the rest **one** package (3) final payment is under preparation till Q4, Y3.

**Under batch-2,** all 9 packages (1-9) are tender under processes till Q4, Y3.

**Rangpur City Corporation, Batch-1 sub-projects**

Package (#)	Progress (%)	
	Physical	Financial
RpCCB1-01	100	100
RpCCB1-02	87	84
RpCCB1-03	100	98
RpCCB1-04	60	54
RpCCB1-05	100	94
RpCCB1-06	85	63
RpCCB1-07	95	87
RpCCB1-08	96	72
RpCCB1-09	100	86
RpCCB1-10	96	85
RpCCB1-11	85	54
RpCCB1-12	90	82
RpCCB1-13	100	68
RpCCB1-14	100	80
RpCCB1-15	87	79
RpCCB1-16	85	72
RpCCB1-17	100	85
RpCCB1-18	93	90

**Analysis:**

**Under batch-1,** out of total 18, completed 100% civil works of **seven** packages (1, 3, 5, 9, 13, 14 & 17) followed by 100%, 98%, 94%, 86%, 68%, 80% & 85% payment progress; 90-98% civil works of **five** packages (7, 8, 10, 12, & 18) followed by 87%, 72%, 85%, 82% & 90% payment progress; 87%, 85%, 85%, 87% & 85% civil works of **five** packages (2, 6, 11, 15 & 16) followed by 84%, 63%, 54%, 79% & 72% payment progress; and completed 60% civil works of remaining **one** package( 4) followed by 54% payment progress till Q4, Y3.

**Rangpur City Corporation, Batch-2 sub-projects**

Package (#)	Progress (%)	
	Physical	Financial
RpCCB2-15	2	0
RpCCB2-16	7	0
RpCCB2-17	3	0
RpCCB2-18	8	0
RpCCB2-19	5	0

**Analysis:**

**Under batch -2**, out of total 25, started civil works of **five** packages (15, 16, 17, 18 & 19), made progress 2%, 7%, 3%, 8% & 5% respectively; and signed contracts for **seven** packages (5, 7, 8, 9, 14, 20 & 23) till Q4, Y3.

**Gazipur City Corporation, Batch-1 sub-projects**

Package (#)	Progress (%)	
	Physical	Financial
GCCB1-01	60	37
GCCB1-02	100	79
GCCB1-03	46	29
GCCB1-04	62	27
GCCB1-05	60	41
GCCB1-06	100	89
GCCB1-07	90	69
GCCB1-08	81	43
GCCB1-09	100	84

**Analysis:**

**Under batch-1**, out of total 9, completed 100% civil works of **three** packages (2, 6 & 9) followed by 79%, 89% & 84% payment progress; 80-90% civil works of **two** packages (7 & 8) followed by 69% & 43% payment progress; 60-70% civil works of **three** packages (1, 4 & 5) followed by 37%, 27% & 41% payment progress; and completed 46% civil works of remaining **one** package (3) followed by 29% payment progress till Q4, Y3.

**Gazipur City Corporation, Batch-2 sub-projects**

Package (#)	Progress (%)	
	Physical	Financial
GCCB2-03	2	0
GCCB2-04	2	0
GCCB2-07	9	0
GCCB2-09	3	0
GCCB2-10	3	0
GCCB2-11	2	0
GCCB2-12	2	0
GCCB2-13	13	0

**Analysis:**

**Under batch-2**, out of total 14, started civil works of **eight** packages (3, 4, 7, 9,10, 11, 12 & 13), made progress 2%, 2%, 9%, 3%, 3%, 2%, 2%, & 13% respectively and signed contracts for **three** packages (2, 6 & 8) till Q4, Y3.

**Chittagong City Corporation, Batch-1 sub-projects**

Package (#)	Progress (%)	
	Physical	Financial
ChCCB1-01	100	74
ChCCB1-02	100	60
ChCCB1-03	95	81
ChCCB1-04	100	92
<b>ChCCB1-05</b>	<b>Implemented by other agency</b>	
ChCCB1-06	75	63
ChCCB1-07	90	85
ChCCB1-08	90	84
ChCCB1-09	80	74
ChCCB1-10	70	60
ChCCB1-11	100	79
ChCCB1-12	100	85
ChCCB1-13	100	84
<b>ChCCB1-14</b>	<b>Shifted in batch-2</b>	
ChCCB1-15	70	75
ChCCB1-16	40	22
ChCCB1-17	90	85
ChCCB1-18	85	76

**Analysis:**

**Under batch-1**, out of total (18-2) 16, completed 100% civil works of **six** packages (1, 2, 4, 11, 12 & 13) followed by 74%, 60%, 92%, 79%, 85% & 84% payment progress; 90-95% civil works of **four** packages (3, 7, 8, & 17) followed by 81%, 85%, 84% & 85% payment progress; 70-85% civil works of **five** packages (6, 9, 10, 15 & 18) followed by 63%, 74%, 60%, 75% & 76% payment progress; and completed 40% civil works of remaining **one** package (16) followed by 22% payment progress till Q4, Y3.

**Under batch-2**, out of 17, signed contracts for **four** packages (10, 12, 13 & 17) till Q4, Y3.

**b) Implementation Time Schedule by sub-projects**

**Narayanganj City Corporation, Batch-1 sub-projects**

Package (#)	Time Allocated (Days)		
	Scheduled	1 <sup>st</sup> Extended	2 <sup>nd</sup> Extended
NCCB1-01	365	72	64
NCCB1-02	365	195	
NCCB1-03	365	165	

**Analysis:**

**Under batch-1**, out of total 3, extended time twice 72 & 64 days for **package-1**; once 195 & 165 days respectively for **package-2** & **3** against scheduled time of 365 days for each till Q4, Y3.

**Under batch-2**, none of the **12 packages** time extension is due up to 30 June 2017.

**Comilla City Corporation, Batch-1 sub-projects**

Package (#)	Time Allocated (Days)		
	Scheduled	1 <sup>st</sup> Extended	2 <sup>nd</sup> Extended
CoCCB1-01	365	74	
CoCCB1-02	365		
CoCCB1-03	365	73	
CoCCB1-04	365	208	
CoCCB1-05	365	75	94
CoCCB1-06	365		
CoCCB1-07	365	238	
<b>CoCCB1-08</b>	<b>Implemented by other agency</b>		
CoCCB1-09	365		

**Analysis:**

**Under batch-1**, out of total (9-1) 8, extended time once 74, 73, 208 & 238 days for **package 1, 3, 4 & 7**; twice 75 & 94 days for **package-05** against scheduled time of 365 days for each till Q4, Y3.

**Under batch-2**, none of the **9 packages** time extension is due till 30 June 2017.

**Rangpur City Corporation, Batch-1 sub-projects**

Package (#)	Time Allocated (Days)		
	Scheduled	1 <sup>st</sup> Extended	2 <sup>nd</sup> Extended
RpCCB1-01	365		
RpCCB1-02	365	449	
RpCCB1-03	365		
RpCCB1-04	365	83	
RpCCB1-05	365		
RpCCB1-06	365	73	107
RpCCB1-07	365	84	
RpCCB1-08	365	84	
RpCCB1-09	365	70	
RpCCB1-10	365	84	
RpCCB1-11	365	85	162
RpCCB1-12	365	85	
RpCCB1-13	365		
RpCCB1-14	365	86	
RpCCB1-15	365		
RpCCB1-16	365		
RpCCB1-17	365	71	
RpCCB1-18	365	448	

**Analysis:**

**Under batch-1**, out of total 18, extended time once 449, 83, 84, 84, 70, 84, 85, 86, 71 & 448 days for **package 2, 4, 7, 8, 9, 10, 11, 12, 14, 17 & 18** respectively; twice 73, 107 & 85, 162 days for **package 6 & 11** against scheduled time of 365 days till Q4, Y3.

**Under batch-2**, none of the **25 packages** time extension is due till 30 June 2017.

**Gazipur City Corporation, Batch-1 sub-projects**

Package (#)	Time Allocated (Days)		
	Scheduled	1 <sup>st</sup> Extended	2 <sup>nd</sup> Extended
GCCB1-01	365	74	76
GCCB1-02	365	74	72
GCCB1-03	365	72	
GCCB1-04	365	72	
GCCB1-05	365	73	
GCCB1-06	365	73	
GCCB1-07	365	74	153
GCCB1-08	365	73	
GCCB1-09	365	72	147

**Analysis:**

**Under batch-1**, out of 9, extended time once 72, 72, 73, 73 & 73 days for **package 3, 4, 5, 6, & 8 respectively**; twice 74 & 76; 74 & 72; 74 & 153 and 72 & 147 days for each **package 1, 2, 7 & 9** respectively against scheduled time of 365 days till Q4, Y3.

**Under batch-2**, none of the **14 packages** time extension is due till to 30 June 2017

**Chittagong City Corporation, Batch-1 sub-projects**

Package (#)	Time Allocated (Days)		
	Scheduled	1 <sup>st</sup> Extended	2 <sup>nd</sup> Extended
ChCCB1-01	365	76	
ChCCB1-02	365	75	
ChCCB1-03	365	71	74
ChCCB1-04	365		
<b>ChCCB1-05</b>	<b>Implemented by other agency</b>		
ChCCB1-06	365	77	107
ChCCB1-07	365	303	
ChCCB1-08	365	303	
ChCCB1-09	365	237	
ChCCB1-10	365	74	115
ChCCB1-11	365	86	
ChCCB1-12	365	86	
ChCCB1-13	365	86	
<b>ChCCB1-14</b>	<b>Shifted in batch-2</b>		
ChCCB1-15	365		
ChCCB1-16	365	236	154
ChCCB1-17	365	66	111
ChCCB1-18	365	231	

**Analysis:**

**Under batch-1**, out of (18-2) 16, extended time once 76, 75 303, 303, 237, 86, 86, 86 & 231 days for **package 1, 2, 7, 8, 9, 11, 12, 13 & 18**; twice 71 & 74; 77 & 107; 74 & 115; 236 & 154 and 66 & 111 days for **package 3, 6, 10, 16 & 17** respectively against scheduled time of 365 days till Q4, Y3.

**Under batch-2**, none of the 17 packages time extension is due till 30 June 2017.

## 5. Challenges of the program

- Promote **role clarity** among the stakeholders and individuals
- Introduce and continue **all ICGIAP activities** by project year 4
- Reassure **facilitation and supervision** guidelines
- Translate ICGIAP **into implementation** plan
- Establish **linkage between facilitation, supervision and implementation** to enhance quality
- Assure meaningful **facilitation and supervision**
- Ensure **attention to process** as described in guidelines
- Activate **regular progress** monitoring and reporting
- Enhance **coordination** between service providing agencies (GO, NGO, Private etc.) under CC territory
- Create **enabling environment** for feedback/learning sharing, and
- Restrict frequent **turnover of key personnel** at CC level.